



This project is funded by the European Union.
Bu proje Avrupa Birliği tarafından finanse edilmektedir.
هذا المشروع تم تمويله من قبل الاتحاد الأوروبي



Conference Report

27-28 June 2019

SOCIAL HARMONIZATION OF FOREIGNERS THROUGH EMPLOYMENT



Implemented by



Report of the Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners Through Employment

ANKARA PROVINCIAL DIRECTORATE OF MIGRATION MANAGEMENT
THE RESEARCH CENTRE ON ASYLUM AND MIGRATION, IGAM

Project Coordinator	Turker Saliji
Project Assistants	Kerim Can Kara Janet Eke İrem Aynagöz Şebnem Belfin Baki
Rapporteurs	Elif Özge Uslu Büşra Efe
Editors	Metin Çorabatır Rhyan Fritzel
Translation	Linas Çeviri, Ankara
Design and Thypography	Kerim Can Kara
Place and Date of Printing	Karınca Ajans, Ankara - July 2019

* This Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreginers through Employment is organized in partnership with the Ankara Provincial Directorate Management, IGAM, Durable Solutions Platform and the Qudra Programme, which is a regional action co-financed by the European Union and the German Government.



- Conference Report -



You can use the QR code or visit

istihdamkonferansi.igamder.org

to access the PDF format of this report, the video broadcasts recorded during the conference, slideshows of the speakers, and more.

(Both Turkish and English versions are available)

This report contains a broad summary of the presentations and opinions presented at the conference, and the views contained in the report may not fully reflect the official views of the Ankara Governorship Provincial Directorate of Migration Management and the Research Centre on Asylum and Migration (IGAM) or the organizations to which the participants are affiliated.

List of Acronyms

BELBİS	Municipality Information System
ECHO	European Civil Protection and Humanitarian Aid Operations
EU	European Union
FRIT	The EU Facility for Refugees in Turkey
GHI (GSS)	General Health Insurance
GIZ	The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GPP	Global Project Partners
IGAM	The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IPA	Instrument for Pre-accession Assistance
ISKUR	Turkish Employment Agency
KEDV	Foundation for the Support of Women's Work
LFIP (YUKK)	Law on Foreigners and International Protection
MNE (MEB)	Ministry of National Education
MPG	Migration Policy Group
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NIEM	National Information Exchange Model
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OSTIM	Middle Eastern Commercial and Industrial Center
PSS (PSD)	Psychosocial support
RIAC	Regional Integration Accelerators Project
RT	Republic of Turkey
SAP	Systems, Applications and Products
SCC (SHM)	Social Care Center
SONİM	Violence Prevention and Monitoring Center
SSGSSK	Social Security and General Health Insurance Law
TBB	Union of Municipalities in Turkey
TOBB	Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey
TOBB ETU	TOBB University of Economics and Technology
TOMER	Turkish and Foreign Language Research and Application Center
TRT	Turkish Radio and Television Corporation
TUGODER	Int. Turcoman Immigrant Refugees Solidarity Association
TUIK	Turkish Statistical Institute
TURKONFED	Turkish Enterprise and Business Confederation
TUSIAD	Turkish Industrialists and Businessmen Association
UN	United Nations
UNHCR	United Nations Refugee Agency
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
YOS	Examination for Foreign Students
YTB	Presidency of Turks Abroad and Related Communities
WALD	World Academy for Local Government and Democracy
WFP	World Food Program

Index

5 Preface

*Metin Çorabatır
Bayram Yalınsu*

9 Introduction

10 Executive Summary

16 Opening Remarks of Day 1

21 Panel 1

*Status, Rights and Obligations of
Foreigners in the Framework of
Social Harmonization*

35 Panel 2

*The Importance of Turkish
Language and Vocational Training
in the Framework of Social
Harmonization: Sustainability of
Employment*

41 Panel 3

*University Graduates and Foreigners
with Professions & Foreign Graduates
from Turkish Universities and Their
Access to the Labour Market*

52 Panel 4

*Employment Alternatives for
Foreigners Living in Turkey:
Entrepreneurship and Social
Cooperatives*

57 Opening Remarks of Day 2

60 Presentation

*Best Practices: Sharing
Experience of Employers and
Employees*

71 Roundtable 1

*Status, Rights and Obligations of
Foreigners in the Framework of
Social Harmonization*

74 Roundtable 2

*The Importance of Turkish
Language and Vocational
Training in the Framework
of Social Harmonization:
Sustainability of Employment*

76 Roundtable 3

*University Graduates and
Foreigners with Professions &
Foreign Graduates from Turkish
Universities and Their Access to
the Labour Market*

79 Roundtable 4

*Employment Alternatives for
Foreigners Living in Turkey:
Entrepreneurship and Social
Cooperatives*

Preface

A Step Towards the First Global Refugee Forum; Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners through Employment



Turkey has been hosting **four million** refugees as of June 2019. Although the entries to the country, voluntary returns and placements in a third country are ongoing in relatively small numbers, this critically huge humanitarian problem of displacement has become long term. It has been exactly nine years since the start of the flux of the individuals who only fled from Syria and requested protection from Turkey (date of the first entries was **29 April 2011**). As historical records were statistically broken, the developments in Syria as the core reasons of the problem, resulted in the extension of the load on the neighboring countries like Turkey and Lebanon, Jordan and Iraq to a period **close to ten years**. As time goes by, this historical forced migration gained new dynamics in the host communities and other places in the world, and it continues to do so at present. Although we can be sure that the overwhelming majority of the refugees will return to their country when a solution within the scope of international guarantees is provided, that is acceptable to the whole Syrian community, **there is an increasing need for an environment in which social harmonization is built and co-existence culture is developed** in the period up to the time when the conditions thereto are made available. With these ideas and assumptions in mind, the Government of

the Republic of Turkey considers policy shifts in the sectors of education, language learning, employment, accommodation and social acceptance, taking into consideration the realities in the field. **In this respect, harmonization strategy document was developed and the year 2019 was declared the “Harmonization Year”.**

Social harmonization is a multi-faceted process which also takes time. Acceptance and harmonization of the differences between the cultural habits of the refugees and the individuals of the host community require great effort. There are close ties between the components of a good harmonization strategy. **Employment is one of the most important elements** of the registered harmonization to the labor market. Despite quite significant steps taken in this field, employment of a community of four million is an extremely challenging, almost impossible situation even for the most developed economies. Constant effort must be exerted to overcome this problem. Achievement in the employment of refugees will bring their potential to the fore and help them and their families to economically survive in a way that is compatible with human dignity and ensure their development. Also, they will contribute to the economic development and stability of the host community and country. As part of this awareness,

Governorate of Ankara, Provincial Directorate of Migration Management and Research Center on Asylum and Migration (IGAM) organized a Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners through Employment and brought together all relevant stakeholders. It was aimed to convene the representatives from the public and private sector, NGOs, academy, international organizations, foreign experts and refugees-foreigners around a table to discuss the challenges and opportunities for employment. The conference held on 27-28 June 2019 in Ankara, which was the **first of its kind in Turkey** received a great deal of attention. Problems concerning employment, legal legislation and other elements of harmonization, mainly employment and education were dealt with in detail. Strong support of the **General Directorate of Migration Management** helped open up such a sincere and transparent channel for discussion and provision of a solution.

This report constitutes the most significant output of the Conference. As the General Directorate of Migration Management, Governorate of Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management and IGAM, we believe that the subjects taken up, shared good examples and the suggested possible solutions will guide the upcoming policies and projects, as well as the individuals who wish to conduct studies. Conference was organized with generous finan-

cial contributions of the **Qudra Programme**, a regional action co-financed by the European Union and the German Government and the **Durable Solutions Platform**. We would like to thank all participants of the conference, experts who moderated the panels and delivered speeches, stakeholders who shared good examples, distinguished moderators of the round table discussions and guests who made contributions. We are grateful to the estimable experts of the Governorate of Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management Harmonization and Communication Department who carried out the preparations for months, our Project Coordinator Mr. Turker Saliji, our Project Assistants Mr. Kerim Can Kara, Ms. Janet Eke, Ms. İrem Aynagöz and Ms. Şebnem Belfin Baki, our editor Ms. Rhyan Fritzel, and our rapporteurs Ms. Elif Özge Uslu and Ms. Büşra Efe for their efforts.

We believe that the conference and its report will shed light on the preparations of Turkey for the Global Refugee Forum to be held, co-hosted by the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR) and Switzerland, to be jointly organized by Turkey, Costa Rica, Ethiopia and Germany on 17-18 December 2019 in Geneva, to which President of the Republic of Turkey Mr. Recep Tayyip Erdoğan confirmed their participation.

Metin Çorabatır

*President of the Research Centre on
Asylum and Migration*

Preface

As Ankara PDMM We Work With A Humanitarian Approach



The phenomenon of migration, which is as old as the history of humanity, has never been so widespread and visible. In today's world, this phenomenon can now transform bilateral and regional relations by affecting security, national identity, sovereignty and power. In this century, our country has carried out activities that can serve as an example to the world in the field of migration and has established its own legislation with Law no. 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection, which entered into force on 11 April 2013. Considering also the balance between human rights and security, our law, which complies with international law and agreements, has been successfully implemented from the day of its entry into force in our country, which currently hosts the highest number of foreigners.

Our law, stipulating the rights and obligations of foreigners and containing detailed provisions on practices that will be carried out in the field of migration, is also the law of establishment of our Directorate General of Migration Management which is also a civilian institution and aims to manage the phenomenon of migration with a staff specialized in the field of migration. Our Directorate General which, since its date of establishment, took over the affairs and procedures concerning the foreigners in our country in the third year of the Syrian crises that started on 28 April 2011 started to be organized right in the middle of the Syrian crisis, and put into practice the Temporary Protection Regulation that was enacted by the Council of Ministers

just six months after its establishment.

Despite the high number of foreigners arriving in our country as a result of the Syrian crisis, it has great achievements in all areas of migration such as International Protection, Temporary protection, Residence permits, Combating Irregular Migration, Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking, etc., and completed its organization in 81 provinces following a period as short as 1 year.

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, one of the 81 provincial organizations of our Directorate General, has started carrying out the work and implementing procedures within the framework of the instructions stipulated both in our law and by our Directorate General since 18 May 2015, and continues its operations with unchanged dedication with its expert staff.

We are handling the issues such as the foreigners' access to healthcare, education and labor market with a rights-based approach in all our transactions. We are aware of the fact that depriving someone of the right to education and employment will create lost generations. It is essential that foreigners are able to maintain their lives as individuals who can protect their basic life skills in the society, both for our country and for the countries where these people will go back to.

Within this framework, our Directorate General and provincial organizations are intensively carrying out activities with the same sensitivity and diligence in order to facilitate social

harmonization of foreigners in our country during their period of stay in our country, along with the necessary assessments in terms of both ensuring their access to rights and services and ensuring public order and security.

In Ankara province, however, harmonization activities are basically performed in the form of intensive information and awareness-raising studies. In this field, the foreigners are provided with necessary information about the rights they have during their stay in our country, as well as their obligations, access to services and the manners, customs and traditions of the society they live with. Besides, necessary studies are carried out against any possible xenophobia and racism that might be caused by any misinformation in the eyes of our society; and in particular, information activities are performed intensively at the provincial, district and even neighborhood level, through the elimination of false facts.

In all our social harmonization efforts, we have been carrying out work together with many non-governmental organizations and universi-

ties along with the support of our Directorate General, Governorate and other public institutions, and are aiming at executing the harmonization process in a healthy manner.

We have been maintaining the social harmonization process without ignoring the issues of overcoming the language barrier, establishing intercultural interaction, and the contributions of participation in education and working life, and have been engaged in efforts in this field. In the end, the present conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners Through Employment is one of the most concrete examples of this.

I would like to thank our Directorate General of Migration Management and Governorate for not sparing their support for us in this comprehensive and valuable study, IGAM team and personnel of our Directorate with whose cooperation we have realized this conference together in a harmonious manner, as well as all other institutions and organizations which have enabled putting into practice of this conference for their efforts, and wish you all continued and fruitful works.

Bayram Yalinsu

*Deputy Head of the Ankara Provincial
Directorate of Migration Management*

Introduction

Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners through Employment was performed starting with opening speeches and followed with four panels, presentation of good examples and four round table meetings of wide participation. Panel topics were organized in a certain logical sequence. In the 1st Panel with the theme of the Statuses, Rights and Responsibilities of the Foreigners in Our Country within the Scope of Social Harmonization, three experts from the General Directorate of Migration Management and an expert from the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Policies talked about the working conditions, legislation and practices of the Syrian and non-Syrian foreigners from the perspective of the public institutions directly related with the topic. Academic participant who took the floor in the same panel made an evaluation of the concept of harmonization in the framework of international academic approaches. Talking about the employment of refugees and foreigners, its relation with education cannot be neglected. Therefore, the second panel of the Conference was allocated to the speeches and discussions under the theme of “Importance of Turkish Language Teaching and Vocational Education within the scope of Harmonization”. Panelists who are representatives of the public sector, NGOs and academicians noted that the obligations for the Syrians to work impeded their education and they would be guided towards vocational training courses and institutions, in an attempt to overcome this situation, where they could continue working and studying at the same time.

Registered employment opportunities that the refugee graduates who had studied in the universities in Turkey can have in terms of qualified labor force have been taken up in the third panel entitled “Participation of University Graduate Foreigners and/or Those Having a

Profession to Employment and the Foreigners Who Have Graduated from the Universities in Turkey”. In an environment where the paid and registered employment opportunities are limited, opportunities for the refugees to establish their business or develop alternative means to generate income gains importance. With this idea in mind, fourth Panel of the Conference was entitled “Alternative Job Opportunities for Foreigners in Turkey: Entrepreneurship and Social Cooperatives”.

The part where the representatives of various NGOs and employer associations summarized the examples of good practices, specified the need for creative ways to increase employment. Examples of good practices were preparatory for the selection of the examples of good practices that can be shared in the Global Refugee Forum meeting to be held in Geneva on 17-18 December 2019 pursuant to the Global Refugee Agreement signed by about 180 countries in December 2018. Round Table Discussions were also held with the participation of almost all stakeholders and in four groups. Round table discussions were held in a semi-structured manner with a wider and free participation. Themes of the round table discussions were identified in parallel with the themes of the panels. In this way, it was aimed to offer possible solutions in the form of joint discussion and brainstorming to the problem areas that emerged during the panel speeches.

Large summary of the speeches, deciphering of the recordings and the notes of the rapporteurs were compared and conveyed in the following parts of this report authentically, as much as possible. In order to minimize the possible errors such as misunderstanding and misquotation, these texts were shared with each speaker and were subjected to a “self-approval” process.

Executive Summary

Harmonization and Employment

Employment

Fundamental principle of the Conference on Social Harmonization of Foreigners through Employment was to discuss the problem of ensuring harmonization of the foreigners with different statuses within the scope of the Law on Foreigners in Turkey and International Protection with the Turkish community by means of employment within the framework of the universal documents of human rights, international refugee law and the relevant rules of the national law, specifically the constitution. Although the participants presented different approaches, they all noted that the four elements below would be efficient for the success of the harmonization policies:

1. General structure of the Syrian refugee population in Turkey distributed in the provinces and regions, as there are differences in terms of the educational-cultural levels, work skills, ratio of genders; ratio of children-adults, men-women, the elderly-young;
2. The capacity, distribution of employment and sectors and unemployment rates in the cities where the refugees have settled;
3. Legislation regulating the working conditions;
4. Current economic structure of the country, inflation, unemployment and foreign exchange fluctuations.

As known, Articles 6 and 23 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights stipulates that everyone has the right to work and the freedom to unrestrainedly choose the job he/she will perform without any discrimination. In part three of the convention relating to the Status of Refugees dated 1951, the issues regarding the right to work have been taken up un-

der the title of "Gainful Employment". Article 17 is on wage-earning employment, Article 18 is on self-employment and Article 19 is on liberal professions. According to these Articles, it has been specified that the country of residence is required to provide the conditions for the refugees who reside in the country legally to work in their respective areas and operate their business. Also, it is stated that the contracting state is required to provide refugees the opportunity to work under the most appropriate conditions in a way that the citizens of that country do. Part 3 Article 6 of the United Nations Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights regulates that the contracting states vest the right for all to work in a job that they choose, and Article 7 regulates the right to benefit from fair and favorable working conditions. Article 18 of the European Social Charter includes regulations concerning ensuring equal working conditions and Article 19 includes those regarding the protection of migrant workers and their family members. Although the theme of the conference is employment as an instrument for social harmonization, nonetheless panelists and speakers talked about the links of employment with education, language teaching, legal legislation, health, access to social services and accommodation sectors, as well as its interwoven nature with the issues of children's rights and gender equality.

In the conference, international refugee law, the right to labor, and especially the regulations concerning the right to labor in the European Union countries and opportunities and examples that the relevant legislation, especially the Constitution in Turkey creates were compared. Provisions of the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees dated 1951 were touched

upon which prohibits discrimination and envisages pursuing policies ensuring equality, and sometimes more tolerance, to the refugees, citizens or foreigners in the most advantageous condition. It has been reminded that the legal legislation of Turkey is compliant to the universal norms in terms of the constitution, international fundamental human rights law that Turkey is a party to and the general framework of its national legislation aligned thereto. It has been stated that the State of the Republic of Turkey is a party to the universal agreements on the right to labor, which is a universal right. National framework on the right to labor has been summarized by the conference participants, as follows:

Everyone has the freedom to work and conclude contracts in a field of his/her choice in accordance with the constitution (Article 48). However, Article 16 of the constitution regulates that the fundamental rights and freedoms of the foreigners may be restricted with the law in accordance with the international law.

In terms of access to labor market, the Article 89/4 of the Law on the Foreigners and International Protection specifies that “Applicant or the conditional refugee may apply for obtaining work permit six months from the international protection application”. In accordance with the

Law, refugee or the owner of the secondary protection status may work as contracted or self-employed once he/she obtains the status. The identity card to be issued to the refugee (defined in Article 61) or the owner of the secondary protection status (defined in Article 63) also serves as the work permit.

However, when the issues are reduced to the rights of the foreigners under international protection in a similar situation with the conditional refugees and the individuals who benefit from the temporary protection, it has been noted that there were significant gaps that needed to be eliminated in terms of an ideal harmonization policy, despite the legal and administrative reforms that Turkey has carried out concerning the refugee/international protection regime from 2013. Restraining and challenging rules and practices have been especially highlighted in the area of access to employment, which is the main conference theme.

It has been highlighted that it was necessary to constantly monitor the policies of harmonization/integration and access to employment and the change that they create by means of the methods developed by the organizations like Belgium-based “Migration Policy Group”, and evaluate the outcomes for ensuring corrective interventions.

“The importance of the social harmonization for employment was emphasized, along with its other elements like education”

Why Harmonization?

No one in the world expected that the incidents that started with demonstrations against the regime in Syria in 2011 and turned into a civil war in a short while would go on for nine years. In this respect, Turkey had the tendency of providing “Temporary Protection”, as Syrians entered to Turkey en masse, based on the Temporary Protection Clause regulated in the Article 91 of

the Draft Law on the Foreigners and International Protection in 2011, which was not passed into law by then. Temporary protection status of the Syrians was made official with the regulation passed following the approval of the Bill of Law on the Foreigners and International Protection in the Parliament and publication of the same on the Official Gazette (2013). In this framework, the services that Turkey provided

for the Syrian refugees were based on the concept of “temporary” until mid-2016. For example, accommodation model was determined as camps, education was attempted to be provided by the temporary education centers and the opportunity to obtain work permit was provided. However, as the crisis extended, it directed Turkey and supporting international community to adopt permanent harmonization policies.

In terms of permanence, there has been a consensus at the conference that the overwhelming majority of the Syrian refugees under temporary protection in Turkey may go back home on voluntary basis, as the conditions in their country which resulted in their refugee status disappear; however, it might take years. As a result, it has been noted that the harmonization of the refugees and the host community is indispensable for the development of the country, welfare of the individuals and economic stability. In this regard, the importance of the social harmonization for employment was emphasized, along with its other elements like education. It was reminded that the forced migration movements were not a new phenomenon for these territories, and the land of Anatolia had seen serious and massive flux of migration in all historical periods. It was noted by the speakers that the strength of Turkey in the endeavors to overcome this humanitarian crisis as the country that hosts the largest number of refugees in the world at present could be attributable to its lengthy history of migration. As a result of the positive point of view that the massive migration movements in history created in the political and social culture of the country, it was stated that around 4.8 million foreigners from 192 nationalities benefit from the right to live without fear, having international protection or temporary protection status or the residence permit in Turkey, today.

Another important point highlighted at the conference was that Turkey has not only been exposed to forced migration and irregular mi-

gration flux in the recent years, but also the number of those who entered to the country by regular migration movements and settled in Turkey with residence permit, as a result of the enhanced political and economic stability, reached to one million. However, it was argued that the number of irregular migrants also increased, and the number of irregular migrants that could be detected has reached up to 200 thousand in the recent years.

Also, the international organizations that were represented in Turkey pointed that there is a need for further solidarity with the countries that provide protection to large number of refugees like Turkey. They believed that the Global Refugee Agreement that was signed in late 2018 would serve this purpose, they noted. Delegate of the United Nations High Commission for Refugees who took the floor at the conference said: “The number of displaced people increased by 2 folds when compared to 20 years before. 70.8 million people fled from their countries due to the reasons such as war and forced displacement and half of them were children. Syrian crisis has been ongoing for 8 years. Turkey hosts 3.6 million Syrians. This amounts up to 4 million people with the refugees coming from other countries. This conference is very important for them to be integrated with society. Many thanks to the Turkish community and state for their generosity. UNHCR also supports the communities that Turkey hosts. There are pressures imposed by the refugees coming to Turkey. Also, support is provided for eliminating such pressures.”

Human-oriented approach

It was emphasized in the conference that harmonization was a reciprocal phenomenon, and it was suggested that needs-based approaches should be considered when policies were determined since migrants and refugees do not constitute a homogeneous group. Also, it was argued that harmonization policies had various actors and the importance of providing

“Around 4.8 million foreigners from 192 nationalities benefit from the right to live without fear, having international protection or temporary protection status or the residence permit in Turkey”

opportunity for the local community and refugees to participate was highlighted, as these policies are developed.

Some international panelists also noted that the participation of refugees to economy was critically important for self-sufficiency and sustainability. It was emphasized that Turkey managed to be more reasonable and flexible when compared to the harmonization policies of Germany, which constantly tends to make regulations. It was expressed that full integration of refugees and migrants to the German labor market could take up to five years, according to a research by OECD.

Experts from the General Directorate of Migration Management who took the floor in different parts of the Conference noted that the migration management system of Turkey was established in 2013 by the Law no: 6458, and numerous serious and critical subjects including the prevention of irregular migration, supporting regular migration, international protection, registering and status operations related to the temporary protection were covered particularly in the early periods. Experts said: “To us, the issue of harmonization is important and we talk about the subject of harmonization since we know that the migrants are much more to the recently given statistics. Actually, every single individual among 4.8 million people bring in their luggage their experiences, pasts, cultures, pains and hopes to our country.”

On the other hand, it was also suggested that being a part of the working life could have an effect on the individuals to overcome post-war trauma in a rehabilitative manner.

Work permit procedures

It was specified in the conference that registered employment of the Syrian refugees was regulated by the temporary protection regulation no: 6883 and the preliminary conditions and operations required for a Syrian to obtain work permit were summarized as below:

- To have a temporary protection identity card for a minimum period of 6 months;
- To sign an employment contract with the employer;
- Employer to enter the details of the foreigner with Syrian nationality to be employed in e-State account and upload the portrait photograph of the foreigner as well as the concluded contract to the e-State account.

It was noted by the speakers in the conference that the authority to issue work permit was the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, and some restraining rules were mentioned such as the number of people under temporary protection that are intended to be employed in a work place should not exceed 10% of the workers who are Turkish citizens in the same work place, working in some fields of profession requires preliminary permission and permission cannot be obtained for working in another work place at the same time. It was noted that the maximum period of work permits was 1 year and there were provisions of making an application two months in advance for the renewal of the same. It was pointed that the legislation regulating the working life included additional restraining rules in the fields of health and education, as well.

Other restraining and complicating practices in obtaining work permit were expressed by different speakers, as below: Syrians who have been present in Turkey for minimum six months under temporary protection can be registered to the Provincial Directorates of Labor and Employment Agency as “job seekers” with their identity cards that evidence this situation; at the registration phase, the applicant is given the registration document including his/her identity details, which is valid for thirty days, specifying that he/she has applied for the international protection; registration document may be extended for periods of 30 days if necessary; registration document provides the opportunity for the applicant to stay in Turkey and it is free of charge.

The law include opportunities for the provision of information, attorney, and fundamentally, translation.

It was reiterated that one significant restraint for access to employment was the provisions regarding the freedom to travel. Article 71 regarding the residence obligation and the responsibility of notification under the regulation concerning work permit, envisages that the applicant can be imposed with the obligation to reside in a province or at an acceptance and accommodation center indicated. In parallel, under Article 82 that regulates the residence of the conditional refugee and the owner of secondary protection status, obligation is imposed to the conditional refugees and the owners of the secondary protection status by the General Directorate of Migration Management to reside in a certain province and make notifications within specified periods following certain procedures, due to public order or public security concerns. They are obliged to register in the address registration system and notify their residence address to the governorate. However, an identity card for a period of three years that has the foreigner identity number is issued to those given the refugee status, while an identity card for a period of one year that has the for-

eigner identity number can be issued to those given the conditional refugee and secondary protection status.

Some of the speakers at the conference expressed that the problems associated with obtaining work permit are among the most significant factors that instigate non-registered employment.

Link between education and employment

Direct links between education and harmonization and access to working life were touched upon in the conference. In this respect, the measures taken by the Government were shared in detail by the participants representing the public institutions; on the other hand, difficulties and obstacles were also mentioned. In addition, it was noted that 643,058 (61.39%) school-aged children out of one million Syrian children have been included in teaching & learning system.

Importance of the Public Education Centers for the training of Syrian refugees was reiterated and it was expressed that 3487 training modules in hundreds of different areas were prepared to be used by a total of 993 public education centers. Until now, in total, 34,900,579 people have been provided with educational opportunities at these centers considering different age groups and regional requirements, according to the data provided. Also, it was noted that these institutions, to which especially the women and disadvantaged groups access easily and where these people can receive information and education in any field they require, have undertaken an important role in education of the Syrian adults as well. Participants in general argued that the failure to learn and understand the Turkish language actually mean the failure to understand the rules and regulations. Although İŞKUR had not included language teaching in its activities since its establishment in 1946, it was stated that the situation changed with the Syrian crisis. It was noted that a good

understanding of the rules and regulations required having learnt the language of that country, and the failure to speak the language created a great obstacle for harmonization. Also, having learnt the Turkish language prevented the exploitation of the Syrians who worked during their working life; and in this way one could claim his/her rights, talk to the employers and develop skills to manage his/her problems. It was expressed during the speeches that the importance of the vocational high schools and vocational education centers increased in the education policies of the Government, and in consequence, it became possible for the Syrians to work and study at the same time.

It was suggested in the conference that vocational education was an opportunity for em-

ployment and social harmonization, and it was agreed that many vocational courses provided under numerous projects failed to make a considerable contribution to the registered employment due to the difficulty of obtaining work permit.

It was expressed that it was theoretically possible for the Syrians to establish business and contribute to the Turkish economy; however, the Syrians who would like to establish business in Turkey were confronted with some difficulties. It was specified that in the interviews conducted with Syrian refugees and Turkish employers, it was argued that establishing business in Turkey for the Syrians in Turkey was much more complicated than doing so in Syria.



OPENING REMARKS OF DAY 1



Ali Rıza Beşkat

General Directorate of Migration Management, Deputy Head of Harmonization and Communication Department

Before commencing with my speech, I greet you all with respect. Migration is not a new phenomenon in our country, the Anatolian territory where we are living has seen significant waves of mass migration throughout history. These migrations have shaped and created our present civilization. Looking back at our recent history, people from very different segments of society such as Bulgarian immigrants, Thessalonian immigrants, Caucasian immigrants and people that arrived within the scope of the population exchange came to our country during the foundation period of our state, and have now been harmonized with our society. Likewise, when we look at the recent era, people came to our land en masse as a result of the events that took place in Iraq and Iran, and our state, nation and civilization have all successfully managed these migrations. The humanitarian crisis and the civil war that started in Syria in 2011 has caused mobility of a greater number of people and as a result the migration has become more massive. As a consequence of this migration, as of today, 4.8 million foreigners from about 192 different nationalities maintain their life in our country under international protection, temporary protection status or as residence permit

holders. In 2013, our country's migration management system was established under the law no. 6458. We have come a long way on very serious and crucial matters, in particular the prevention of irregular migration, the promotion of regular migration and performing the registration and status procedures for international protection as well as temporary protection. At this stage, the element of harmonization, another integral and significant component of migration management in 2018-2019 and in the upcoming process, has come to the forefront. This started in 2018-2019 and of course, the issue of harmonization is regulated under Law no. 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection. When we read the cited law efficiently, the principle of reciprocity comes to the forefront in terms of harmonization. Issues such as informing Turkish citizens to prevent various adversities also play a role in terms of harmonization. In addition to these activities in various areas of harmonization, such as education, health issues and providing employment and information for foreigners as is the case today, are being carried out. Therefore, the reciprocity aspect of harmonization is important to us. Thus, very inclusive policies in terms of harmonization are being considered and implemented. We attach importance to the issue of harmonization and put the issue of harmonization into words because we know that migrants are much more than just the numbers and statistics indicated just now.

In fact, every single one of the 4.8 million people is a human being, and while they leave behind their good old familiar land and head for ours, they also bring along in their suitcases their own experience, past, culture, pain and hopes into our country. It is important to us that the foreigners are included in employment and education, actively benefitting from healthcare services, properly learning about their rights and obligations within our country and live in peace accordingly in our country. In addition, we are engaged in serious studies aimed at informing

our own society and preventing disinformation. Of course, we always feel the support of the relevant non-governmental organizations and international organizations that support us within the scope of these activities. By managing migration properly as a whole, we are striving towards achieving effective migration management with more solid and more accurate foundations. With these feelings and thoughts in mind, I thank you very much for listening to me. I would like to thank the organizers and to IGAM for giving me the opportunity to speak.



Metin Çorabatır

President of the Research Centre on Asylum and Migration

Good morning dear representatives from relevant public institutions, domestic and international non-governmental organizations, universities, international organizations and the EU; dear guests, welcome to our conference. First of all, as Mr. Ali Rıza stated, it is of special importance to hold such a comprehensive meeting on employment during the year of harmonization declared by our government. That's because employment is one of the most important elements of harmonization. Secondly, the issue of employment of the refugees will be handled in a public meeting which is seeing a high-level of participation from different communities such as public institutions, NGOs, international organizations, professional chambers, refugee representatives, etc. for the first time in Turkey, and which brings together all stakeholders. Some

deficiencies are only natural in such a well-attended conference since it is being arranged for the first time. Nevertheless, we are convinced that we will be able to obtain good results. We have arranged this conference in cooperation with Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management and IGAM. The conference was held with the generous contributions of GIZ, a German body, and its QUDRA Project. Likewise, Durable Solutions Platform provided support for the arrival of our foreign guests from abroad. We thank them very much.

Turkey has provided temporary protection for 3.6 million Syrian citizens. Besides, approximately 400,000 citizens from other countries have applied for international protection or have been granted conditional refugee status in Turkey. Mr. Abdullah Ayaz, General Director of Migration Management, has said, as reflected in the press, that "The total number of foreigners registered in Turkey as of last week is about 4.9 million". This number points to both the refugees and other foreigners residing in Turkey.



I think we will have to keep the difference between the status of these 4.9 million foreigners in the foreground during the discussions we will make today and tomorrow. That's because the differences in status are the elements that will lead us to different conclusions. In the discussions that will be made, for how long the refugees have lived in Turkey and the role of access to employment in this phase are among the issues that needs to be taken into consideration. In short, today and tomorrow we will be evaluating the refugees' right to employment and their employment opportunities, as well as the challenges they face in this regard, in the light of the international law, Turkish legislation and social realities.

The most important thing that separates a refugee from a foreigner in a country is that the refugee cannot benefit from the protection of their homeland country. For instance, the foreigners who have a work permit in Turkey, who have come to our country as a student or wish to spend their retirement in Turkey enjoying the sunlight and therefore have settled in Turkey are backed by the protection of their home country. The situation of the refugees is completely different. The refugees by definition cannot benefit from the protection of their home country. Therefore, the persons in this position are tak-

en under international protection. The country they take refuge in offers them protection on behalf of the international community. The most important international legal text concerning the protection of refugees is the 1951 Geneva Convention and its protocol dated 1967. Article 3 of the 1951 Convention stipulates that the Contracting States shall apply the provisions of the convention to refugees without discrimination as to race, religion or country of origin. As per Article 7 of the same convention, a host country shall accord to refugees the same treatment as is accorded to aliens generally. International refugee law allows refugees to deepen and expand their rights in parallel with the development of their ties with the state in which they are located. As the refugees' legal duration of stay increases, their rights in that particular country are also deepened and expanded.

Article 7 of the Convention stipulates the following: "Except where this Convention contains more favorable provisions, a Contracting State shall accord to refugees the same treatment as is accorded to aliens generally." The refugees' wage-earning employment is regulated under Article 17 of the same convention. Under Article 17, Wage-Earning Employment:

"1- The Contracting State shall accord to refugees lawfully staying in their territory the most

favorable treatment accorded to nationals of a foreign country in the same circumstances, as regards the right to engage in wage-earning employment.

2- In any case, restrictive measures imposed on aliens or the employment of aliens for the protection of the national labor market shall not be applied to a refugee who was already exempt from them at the date of entry into force of this Convention for the Contracting State concerned, or who fulfils one of the following conditions:

(a) He has completed three years' residence in the country;

(b) He has a spouse possessing the nationality of the country of residence.

A refugee may not invoke the benefits of this provision if he has abandoned his spouse;

(c) He has one or more children possessing the nationality of the country of residence.

3- The Contracting States shall give sympathetic consideration to assimilating the rights of all refugees with regard to wage-earning employment to those of nationals, and in particular of those refugees who have entered their territory pursuant to programmes of labor recruitment or under immigration schemes."

Article 24 of the Convention concerning social standing is as follows:

"The Contracting States shall accord to refugees lawfully staying in their territory the same treatment as is accorded to nationals in respect of the following matters:

(a) In so far as such matters are governed by laws or regulations or are subject to the control of administrative authorities: remuneration, including family allowances where these form

part of remuneration, hours of work, overtime arrangements, holidays with pay, restrictions on home work, minimum age of employment, apprenticeship and training, women's work and the work of young persons, and the enjoyment of the benefits of collective bargaining."

On the basis of such responsibilities; on the one hand, there is the understanding that refugees are individuals with fundamental human rights, and on the other hand, that it is not practically possible for refugees to rely on aids forever. When we look at the development of asylum law, it is evident that the right to employment is important in terms of the harmonization of people and their contribution to society.

Turkey remains a party to 1951 Geneva Convention with geographical restrictions. In general, integration was not considered as a permanent solution for migrants coming from outside Europe. However, today we are faced with the challenge of living with approximately 4 million people today. The declaration of this year as the harmonization year is an indicator of this necessity. The most important elements of harmonization are the employment opportunity and the right to employment. We will have important discussions with our esteemed participants and experts in the light of the international law and Turkish legislation for two days. Putting the results of the discussions in writing, we are aiming at both helping political decision makers and making a note in history with the results of these discussions.

I thank you all and wish you a pleasant discussion with creative ideas in the forefront.



Jean-Marie Garelli

UNHCR Deputy Representative to Turkey

Dear guests and colleagues, it is a great pleasure to be here with you today. For eight years the crisis in Syria raged on and it has led to a major wave of displacement and civil violence. As a result, 3.6 million Syrians, the world's largest refugee group, have been welcomed by Turkey. From the outset of the crisis, Turkey and its government agencies have shown generosity and hospitality. Turkey's legal framework, as stated by the representative of the Directorate of Migration Management, offers the refugees the opportunity to access public services such as education, healthcare, social protection, etc. Furthermore, it doesn't exclude granting them the right to employment and the right of establishment within the law. Therefore, Turkey should be addressed as an exemplary country worldwide by virtue of its attitude in this regard.

Compared with 20 years earlier, the number of displaced people throughout the world has dou-

bled. 70.8 million people have fled their country due to war and forced displacement. Half of this number are children. The Syrian crisis has been going on for eight years. Turkey hosts 3.6 million Syrians. With refugees from other countries, this figure amounts to four million people. This conference is very important for the inclusion of these people in society. Thank you to the Turkish people and government for your generosity. The communities hosted by Turkey also have their share of support from the UNHCR. There are pressures on Turkey brought upon by the refugees. And it is being supported to resolve these pressures. The refugees contribute to the countries they arrive with their culture and skills. They bring along their own resources. It is very important that these people have income sources and stand on their own feet. The availability of these sources makes an important contribution to their process of social harmonization. That's why this conference plays a very important role. With the signing of the global compact on refugees in December 2018, we are continuing with these efforts.



Figure-1
UNHCR Turkey:
Provincial
Breakdown of
Syrian Refugees
in Turkey - May
2019



PANEL 1: STATUS, RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS OF FOREIGNERS IN THE FRAMEWORK OF SOCIAL HARMONIZATION

Keynote:

Burak Yaşar, *Directorate General of Migration Management*

Moderator:

Metin Çorabatır, *President of the Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Panellists:

Özge Bayar, *Ankara PDMM, Head of the Working Group for Temporary Protection*

Lawyer Sinem Çakan, *Ankara PDMM, Head of the Working Group for Legal Affairs*

Ahmet Danışman, *Ankara PDMM, Migration Expert*

İsmail Yıldırım, *Ankara Provincial Directorate the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services*

Dr. Fulya Memişoğlu, *Yıldız Technical University*



Keynote

Burak Yaşar

General Directorate of Migration Management, Migration Specialist

Inspection of the report published in June 2019 by UNHCR reveals that, except for the Palestinian refugees under UNRWA, the majority of the refugee population is hosted by underdeveloped and developing countries in terms of the distribution of the world refugee population. The fact that only 16% of the world refugee population is hosted by developed countries is one of the most significant proofs of this situation. Especially as a result of the policies it has implemented following the humanitarian crisis in Syria, our country has been the host country for the highest number of refugees in the world for the last five years. This is an indication that our country fulfills its humanitarian and legal responsibilities in the face of a crisis. Besides, taking into consideration that four out of five refugees worldwide live in an area close to their country of origin, we can understand the flow of migration from Afghanistan and Syria, countries generating the highest number of refugees in the World, into our country.

The main body responsible for migration management in Turkey is the General Directorate of Migration Management. The General Directorate of Migration Management, founded in response to the need for specialized civil migration management, was established with Law no. 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection. Starting its operations with the law published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Turkey on 11 April 2013, the General Directorate of Migration Management completed its organization in 81 provinces as of May 2015 and became capable of providing services throughout the country.

Looking at the law of establishment of our General Directorate, we can see that the law is composed of three main sections. The first of

these sections is about foreigners, the second international protection and the third the organization of the General Directorate of Migration Management. This law also forms the main framework for the status, rights and obligations of foreigners in Turkey. Although our country is home to 3.6 million Syrians and 400,000 foreigners under international protection, it has been home to foreigners who have come with various motives for a long time. Besides its position as a transition country, our country has also been transformed into a destination country. The biggest factor in this transformation is the political and economic stability of our country. When we look at the figures of residency in Turkey, the current figure is 992 thousand. This figure also tells us: one of every four foreigners in our country is actually a regular migrant.

While regular migration refers to foreigners' entry into, stay in and leaving the country through legal means such as visa, residence and resettlement, irregular migration refers to entry into, stay in and leaving the country through illegal means. Especially since our eastern borders have a favorable structure for border crossings, our country remains under the pressure of intense irregular migration. When we look at the figures, irregular immigration, which were about 50,000 until 2014, reached 200,000 as of 2014. Since irregular migration is not a process that can be maintained by a single country alone, bilateral agreements are of paramount importance. One of such agreements is the readmission agreement. Our General Directorate is responsible for the execution of these agreements. A memorandum on readmission was signed in March 2016 upon discussions with the EU as a result of the increase in transition from our country to Europe through the Aegean Sea since 2015.

Another area of duty and jurisdiction of our General Directorate is the issue of international protection. Foreigners who cannot take advantage of the rights offered by their home country to the citizens on the grounds elaborated in

the Convention relating to the Legal Status of Refugees dated 1951 or who refuse to take advantage of the same based on a rightful fear are entitled to apply for international protection in our country. The statuses granted by our country within the scope of international protection are refugee, conditional refugee and secondary protection.

Our country has taken the necessary steps as a result of the humanitarian crisis starting in Syria in 2011, and has granted temporary protection status to people coming from Syria, implementing the open door policy. Within this scope, 3.6

million Syrians are now living in our country under temporary protection.

Considering the fact that approximately 1 of every 22 people in our country is a Syrian and 1 of every 16 people is a foreigner, we can see how important it is to ensure mutual harmonization of the host community and foreigners. Within this scope, we are carrying out the necessary activities with all public institutions and organizations in line with the Harmonization Strategy Document and National Action Plan issued in coordination with our General Directorate.

Panellist

Özge Bayar

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, Head of Working Group on Temporary Protection

Dear esteemed participants; first of all, I would like to welcome you all. Today I will try to talk about what temporary protection is, its scope, elements, the rights of the Syrians under temporary protection and the procedures related to the Syrians under temporary protection in our Provincial Directorate of Migration Management. Thank you in advance for including me in this conference and for listening to me.

As you know, migration movements, which have now gained an international characteristic, have settled at the top of the agenda with their political, economic, social and cultural dimensions not only in the receiving countries but also in all geographies where the globalization is felt. At the same time they have turned out to be the key determinants of international relations and international policies. Turkey is one of those countries at the center of such movements since it is located along the important transition routes. Turkey's position as a "transition country" has changed in recent years in terms of the migration movements, and our

country has become a "destination country" at the same time. One of the most important aspects of the Syrian crisis and civil war, which began in March 2011 with the demonstrations and protests triggered by the Arab revolutions that escalated into an increasingly violent civil war, is that it is the worst crisis the world has ever witnessed. The crisis has gained an international character much beyond being a regional crisis.

The flow of asylum seekers from Syria to Turkey began when about 250-300 Syrian citizens fleeing the conflicts in Syria sought asylum in Turkish territories on 29 April 2011. The number we are faced with right now is beyond 3.6 million. Within the framework of the decision to mutually abolish visas between Turkey and Syria in 2009, Turkey adopted the "open-door" policy in light of the refugee crisis, and set up camps in the Hatay province to accommodate the asylum seekers. We implemented the open-door policy unconditionally within the Turkish territory. We also implemented the non-refoulement principle without any exceptions and aimed at meeting all the basic needs of all Syrians that came in the first place.

However, as our colleagues here have suggested, temporary protection gained a legal foundation under the Law no. 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection and the Temporary Protection Regulation no. 6883 dated

22 October 2014. Temporary protection is a form of protection developed to find emergency solutions in cases of mass influx. It is a practical and complementary solution applied to individuals who reach the borders of the country en masse without losing time with individual status determination procedures, within the framework of non-refoulement obligations of the states.

Although temporary protection may appear under the title of international protection, it is described as follows in Article 91 of Law no. 6458: The rights provided by the temporary protection ID documents are as follows:

- Temporary protection shall be provided for foreigners who have been forced to leave their country,
- cannot return to the country that they have left and
- have arrived at or crossed the borders of Turkey in a mass influx situation seeking immediate and temporary protection.

As the central and provincial organization of Migration Management, we carry out works and procedures for foreigners. As the provincial organizations established in 81 provinces, the services rendered by the Provincial Directorate of Migration Management to the Syrians are as follows:

- In the first phase, biometric data of Syrian foreigners residing in their respective provinces are firstly obtained, identification and registration procedures are carried out and a 30-day registration certificate is issued to the individuals. At the end of the 30-day period, the registration certificate of foreigners, whose investigation through the "GöçNet" system does not reveal any unfavorable situation, is taken back and a "Temporary Protection Identity Document" is issued instead.
- Syrians under Temporary Protection, who apply to the directorate for any reason (birth, death, marriage, divorce, change of the province of residence, etc.), are subjected to fingerprint inquiry and identifica-

tion procedures, thereby ensuring that the update procedures are carried out.

- Exit requests of foreigners under temporary protection, who have a visa/residence issued on their behalf by the authorities of a third country, are evaluated, and the necessary procedures are carried to perform the exit procedures of those that are deemed eligible to leave the country.
- Together with the personnel from the Provincial Directorates of Migration Management and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, voluntary repatriation procedures are carried out for those who are evaluated as eligible as a result of the voluntary repatriation request interviews performed with the Syrian foreigners.
- Family reunification requests submitted by foreigners under temporary protection to be reunified in Turkey with their spouses and children in Syria are evaluated, and the necessary procedures are performed.
- Special needs of people with special needs are identified and, in line with their needs, the necessary institutions are informed and these persons are provided with guidance in cooperation with the relevant institutions.
- Within the scope of exceptional citizenship, applications of individuals are received and the files prepared by working in coordination with the provincial security and provincial population directorates are submitted to the related commission.
- Among the Syrian foreigners under temporary protection, those with special needs are referred to the temporary refuge centers with the assent and approval of the general directorate, pursuant to the application of the foreigner.
- The temporary protection identity document shall necessarily include a seal as well as the cachet or registration and signature of the signatory. An embossed stamp seal shall also be present. Unfortunately, it is so easy to produce a fake copy.

- With this document, Syrian foreigners are allowed to travel within the boundaries of their province of residence without needing any certificate. They can only travel outside their province of residence by virtue of a "Travel Permit Certificate". The travel permit certificate is not used alone; it must be used together with the Temporary Protection Identity Document.

The rights provided by the temporary protection identity document are as follows:

- It provides the foreigner in question with the right to legally stay in Turkey.
- It is not subject to any fees and charges.
- It is not equivalent to the residence permit or any document replacing the residence permit as regulated in Law no. 6458.
- It does not provide the right to application for Turkish citizenship or the right to naturalization.

If you have a temporary protection identity card in Turkey as a Syrian;

- You have the right to stay legally.
- You can benefit from healthcare services free of charge.
- You have the right to start and stay in education.
- You have the right to employment by obtaining a work permit.
- You have the right to marry.
- You have the right of access to social assistance directly. (Financial aid, aid in kind, etc.)

However, if you don't have a temporary protection identity card in Turkey as a Syrian;

- You can't find work since you will not be able to obtain a work permit.
- You can benefit from healthcare services, but you have to pay for it.
- You can't benefit from the right to marry.
- You can't benefit from the right to marry.
- You can't benefit from social assistance.

Therefore, the temporary protection certificate is very important for Syrians.

Under Temporary Protection Regulation no.

6883, we, as the general directorate of migration management,

We have legally secured the rights of access to healthcare, education, work permit, social assistance and services.

The relevant ministries to provide services for Syrian foreigners in our country have also determined the sub-legislation to be implemented within the framework of this regulation.

When it comes to the right to employment which is the main topic of this conference, we can explain how the Syrians obtain the work permit:

- They must have an at least 6-month temporary protection identity card.
- They must sign a labor contract with the employer.
- The employer must enter the information of the Syrian foreigner s/he will employ into his/her e-Government account and upload the contract with a passport-size photo of the foreigner to his/her e-Government account.
- The application will be evaluated and approved by the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services.

So, whose work permit application will be acceptable?

- If a Syrian is under temporary protection in Turkey and fulfills the following requirements, his/her work permit application will be acceptable:
- If s/he proves that s/he is under temporary protection (foreigner identity number starting with 99) and has a temporary protection identity card for at least 6 months retrospectively as of his/her date of application for work permit:
- If s/he has submitted his/her application for work permit in the province where s/he has received his/her temporary protection identity,
- If the number of people under temporary protection, who are employed in the workplace where s/he wishes to work,

does not exceed 10% of the workers who are Turkish citizens,

- If s/he wishes to work in a field of occupation requiring a preliminary permit (if s/he will work for healthcare and education services requiring professional qualification) and has obtained the relevant preliminary permit (The preliminary permit certificate shall be issued by the relevant ministry),
- If s/he does not already have a work permit document obtained to be employed in another workplace in Turkey or a pending work permit application, then s/he can obtain work permit.

So, what are the employment quotas and exemptions?

The number of workers under temporary protection who are employed in a workplace may not exceed ten percent of workers who are Turkish nationals employed in the same workplace. However, in the workplaces that do not have any Turkish workers or that have fewer than 10 workers in total, maximum 1 foreigner under temporary protection may be provided with work permit.

Besides, employment quota may not be applied for applications where the employer, through the Provisional Directorate of Labor and Employment Agency in the province where the workplace is registered, documents that no Turkish citizens with the same qualifications could be found to do the work for which the foreigner will be employed during the four-week period preceding the date of work permit application.

What are the Professions Requiring Preliminary Permit?

If a Syrian foreigner is under temporary protection in Turkey and wants to be employed for education or healthcare services requiring professional qualification, s/he needs to obtain preliminary permit. To do this, before the work permit application, s/he must firstly apply for preliminary permit with the relevant ministry. S/he must submit his/her application with the Ministry of Health to be employed in the field

of healthcare services and with the Ministry of National Education to be employed in the field of education.

In what circumstances will the work permit application be rejected?

- If, in the workplace for which s/he has applied, the number of workers under temporary protection in Turkey is greater than one-tenth of the number of workers that are Turkish nationals,
- If the job for which s/he has applied is in one of the fields where only Turkish nationals are allowed to be employed,
- If the job for which s/he has applied is in one of the fields requiring preliminary permit, and the relevant preliminary permit is not obtained,
- If the general criteria of the Ministry of Health laid down for professionals in the field of healthcare services and of the Ministry of National Education or the Council of Higher Education laid down for professionals in the field of education are not fulfilled to obtain the work permit, and if the relevant government agency / agencies gives negative opinion about the application, the work permit application will be rejected.

If a foreigner is provided with temporary protection in Turkey;

- S/he may not be employed or allowed to be employed without obtaining a work permit exemption or a work permit.
- His/her rights and obligations arising from the Labor and Social Security Legislation and other national legislation will be reserved.
- The issued work permit certificate and the information form concerning the work permit exemption will not replace the residence permit.
- S/he may obtain a work permit or a work permit exemption certificate for a period of maximum 1 year. The relevant permit must be renewed at the end of the 1-year period.

- S/he may carry out the relevant renewal process starting with the period sixty days before the expiry of the work permit duration in the first year and before the expiry of the work permit duration in any case.
- If s/he has been in Turkey for at least 6 months under temporary protection and has an identity card to prove this, s/he may

be registered with the Provincial Directorates of Labor and Employment Agency as a “job seeker”.

Currently there are more than 3.6 million Syrians. 109,062 of them stay at the temporary protection center, while the remaining live in the cities. Thank you very much for listening to me.

Panellist

Lawyer Sinem Çakan

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management,
Head of Working Group on Legal Affairs

International framework on rights and freedoms is as follows;

- Convention relating to the legal status of refugees dated 1951
- Covenant on civil and political rights of the United Nations human rights committee
- Convention on social, economic and cultural rights
- European convention on human rights
- European social charter

The National Framework is as follows;

It is regulated under some articles of our Constitution.

Article 10 – Everyone is equal before the law without distinction as to language, race, color, sex, political opinion, philosophical belief, religion and sect, or any such grounds.

Article 12 – Everyone possesses inherent fundamental rights and freedoms, which are inviolable and inalienable.

The fundamental rights and freedoms also comprise the duties and responsibilities of the individual to the society, his/her family, and other individuals.

Article 16 – The fundamental rights and freedoms in respect to aliens may be restricted by law compatible with international law.

Registration and Control

Article 69 – (1) International protection applications shall be registered by the governorates. (7) At the time of registration, the applicant shall be issued a registration document valid for thirty days indicating the international protection application and containing identity information. The registration document would be extended with thirty days validity periods when necessary. The registration document shall enable applicant to stay in Turkey and shall be issued without being subject to any fee.

Article 76 – (1) Upon completion of the interview, the applicant and, if any, accompanying members of his family, shall be issued an “International Protection Applicant Identity Document” valid for six months indicating the international protection application and bearing foreigner identification number. For those when the [assessment of the] application could not be finalized, the identity document shall be extended for a validity period of six months.

(4) The identity document shall substitute a residence permit and shall not be subject to any fee.

ARTICLE 83 – (1) An identity document bearing the foreigner identification number shall be issued to persons granted refugee status, with three years validity period at a time.

(2) Persons granted conditional refugee or secondary protection status shall be given an identity document bearing the foreigner identification number issued with one year validity period at a time.

(3) The identity documents set out in first and

second paragraphs shall substitute a residence permit and shall not be subject to any fee. The directorate general shall determine the format and content of the identity documents.

Services offered to foreigners may be grouped under some titles.

Information and Translation Services

- According to A. 70 of LFIP, applicant shall be informed about the procedures to be followed regarding the application, his/her rights and obligations, and about the procedures for appeal, etc. at the time of the registration.
- Translation service shall be provided for the international protection procedures if requested by the international protection applicants and beneficiaries.
- Applicants and international protection beneficiaries can take advantage of counseling services offered by the non-governmental organizations.

Legal Services and Counselling

Article 81 – (1) Applicants and international protection beneficiaries may be represented by a lawyer regarding activities and actions stipulated in this Part, provided that the [attorney's] fee is covered by them.

(2) In cases where the applicant and international protection beneficiary is unable to afford the attorney's fee for their judicial appeals regarding actions and activities stipulated in this Part, legal assistance shall be provided pursuant to the provisions on legal assistance stipulated in the Attorneyship Law No. 1136.

(3) Applicant and international protection beneficiary may make use of counselling services provided by non-governmental organizations.

Healthcare Services

Article 89 – (2) Access to social assistance and services may be renewed to applicants or international protection beneficiaries who are in need.

(3) For those applicants or international protection beneficiaries who:

a) are not covered with any medical insurance

and do not have financial means [to afford medical services] provisions of the Social Security and Universal Medical Insurance Law № 5510 of 31/05/2006 shall apply. For the payment of the premiums on behalf of persons to benefit from the universal medical insurance, funds shall be allocated to the budget of the Directorate General. Persons, whose premiums are paid by the Directorate General, shall be asked to contribute fully or partially in proportion to their financial means.

b) those who at a later date would be found to already have had medical insurance coverage or the financial means or, to have applied [for asylum] for the sole purpose of receiving medical treatment shall be reported to the Social Security Authority within ten days at the latest for termination of their universal health insurance and the expenditures related to the treatment and medication shall be reimbursed from them.

- International protection applicants and beneficiaries have been regarded as universal health insurance holders within the framework of Law no. 5510.
- These persons that do not have financial means are granted access to healthcare services free of charge as of the date on which they apply for international protection.

Education Services

- Freedom of education and training is guaranteed for everyone in article 42 of our Constitution. General provisions on the freedom of education and training are regulated in the Primary Education and Training Law, the Basic Law of the National Education, Law on Social Services and Child Protection Institution and the Child Protection Law.
- LFIP A. 89/1 Applicant or international protection beneficiary and family members shall have access to primary and secondary education.

It would be more fruitful to focus on the Right to and Freedom of Labor, since it constitutes

the main theme of this conference.

- Since the right to employment is recognized as a universal human right, international documents contain regulations on the right to employment.
- In accordance with Articles 6 and 23 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, everyone has the right to work and the freedom to choose his/her work freely without discrimination.
- Chapter three titled “Gainful Employment” of the 1951 Geneva Convention deals with the issues related to the right to employment. Article 17 concerns wage-earning employment, article 18 self-employment and article 19 liberal professions.
- Emphasis is made on refugees staying lawfully in the country, stating that the country of residence must provide the conditions required for the refugees to become self-employed and to practice a liberal profession.
- It is stated that the contracting state must accord to refugees’ employment opportunities under the most favorable circumstances as accorded to the nationals.
- Article 6 in part 3 of UN Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights stipulates that the states parties to the covenant recognize that everyone has the right to work in a job of their own choosing, while according to article 7 the states parties to the covenant recognize the right of everyone to the enjoyment of just and favorable conditions of work.
- Article 18 of the European Social Charter includes provisions on equal working conditions, and article 19 on protection of migrant workers and their family members.

The national framework on the right to employment is as follows:

Article 48 of the Constitution – Everyone has the freedom to work and conclude contracts in the field of his/her choice.

Restriction

Article 16 of our Constitution stipulates that the

fundamental rights and freedoms in respect to aliens may be restricted by law compatible with international law.

LFIPA. 89/4 With respect to access to the labor market;

- an applicant or a conditional refugee may apply for a work permit after six months following the lodging date of an international protection claim.
- the refugee or the secondary protection beneficiary, upon being granted the status, may work independently or be employed. The identity document to be issued to a refugee or a secondary protection beneficiary shall also substitute for a work permit.
- Principles on employment are regulated under the international workforce law.
- International Workforce Law no. 6735
- Article 6 (2), Foreigners who are within the scope of this law are forbidden to work or be employed in Turkey without obtaining work permit. (3) Foreigners who are specified as exempt from work permit in other laws and conventions to which Turkey is a party may work or be employed without obtaining work permit pursuant to this Law.
- According to Article 7, work permit applications shall be made directly to the ministry within the country, and the applications abroad shall be made to the embassies of which the foreigner is a national or to the consulates in the country where the foreigner is lawfully staying.

Access to Social Assistance and Services

LFIPA. 89/p.2-3

Access to social assistance and services is renewed to applicants or international protection beneficiaries who are in need.

In parallel with this provision, article 2 of the Social Security and General Health Insurance Law is formulated such that the persons to benefit from the universal medical insurance will cover all real persons.

Right to Family Life

Article 20/1 of the Constitution – Everyone has the right to demand respect for his/her private and family life.

LAW NO. 6458 ON FOREIGNERS AND INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION**Family Residence Permit**

Article 34 – (1) A family residence permit for a maximum duration of three years at a time may be granted to the:

- a) foreign spouse;
 - b) foreign children or foreign minor children of their spouse;
 - c) dependent foreign children or dependent foreign children of their spouse;
- of Turkish citizens, persons within the scope of Article 28 of Law No. 5901 or, foreigners holding one of the residence permits as well as refugees and secondary protection beneficiaries.

Freedom of Residence and Movement

Article 23 of the Constitution – Everyone has the freedom of residence and movement.

Freedom of residence may be restricted by law for the purpose of preventing crimes, promoting social and economic development, achieving sound and orderly urbanization, and protecting public property, and freedom of movement may be restricted by law for the purpose of investigation and prosecution of an offence, and prevention of crimes.

(Amended paragraph: 7.5.2010-5982/Art. 3) A citizen's freedom to leave the country may be restricted only by the decision of a judge based on a criminal investigation or prosecution.

Otherwise, asylum seekers tend to reside in big cities or in cities close to big cities.

Access to Personal Files and Confidentiality

Confidentiality and access to personal files

Article 94 – (1) All information and documents pertaining to applicants and international protection beneficiaries shall be confidential.

(2) However, applicants and international protection beneficiaries as well as their legal representative or lawyer may examine or obtain a copy of the documents in the personal file

pertaining to the applicant or international protection beneficiary. Documents relating to the protection of national security and public order and prevention of crime cannot be examined and handed over.

Allowance

Article 89 (5) Other than those falling under Articles 72 and 79, an applicant that would be determined to be in need may be provided with an allowance with the assent of the Ministry of Finance, in accordance with the principles and procedures to be determined by the Ministry.

Obligations

Article 2 of "Geneva Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees" dated 1951 stipulates the following: "Every refugee has duties to the country in which he finds himself, which require in particular that he conform to its laws and regulations as well as to measures taken for the maintenance of public order."

Justice and Principle of Equality Before Law

Article 3 – (1) Offender may be subject to a punishment and imposition of security measures in proportion with the grossness of the illegal acts executed by him. (2) No discrimination can be made between the persons in respect of their race, language, religion, sect, nationality, color, sex, political or other thoughts or opinions, philosophical belief, national or social origin, birth, economic and other social standing for the purpose of implementation of the Penal Code, and no person can be subject to special treatment.

Binding Nature of the Law

Article 4 – (1) Ignorance of the criminal laws may not be an excuse.

Implementation in respect of location

Article 8 – (1) Turkish laws are applied for the offenses which are committed in Turkey. Where the act constituting an offense is partially or entirely committed in Turkey, or the result is obtained in Turkey, the offense is deemed to have been committed in Turkey.

Considering the principle of territoriality and the rule that the penal codes are a result of national sovereignty, it is clearly stated in the article

that Turkish laws will apply for the offences committed in Turkey, regardless of the perpetrator's and the victim's nationality.

Residence and reporting obligations

Article 71 – (1) Administrative obligations may be imposed upon the applicants such as to reside in the designated reception and accommodation centers, a specific location or a province as well as to report to authorities in the form and intervals as requested.

(2) The applicant shall register with the address-based registration system and report domicile address to the governorate.

micile address to the governorate.

Residence of conditional refugees and secondary protection beneficiaries

Article 82 – (1) For reasons of public security or public order, the Directorate General may require conditional refugees and secondary protection beneficiaries to reside at a given province and report to authorities in accordance with determined procedures and periods.

(2) Such persons shall register with the address-based registration system and report domicile address to the governorate.



Panellist

Ahmet Danişman

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, Migration Specialist

We, as Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, have granted residence permit to more than 85,000 foreigners. We have also been providing services to 500,000-600,000 foreigners. The phenomenon of migration is a hard one. Welcoming people from a different nationality with a different language and finding a common ground can sometimes prove to be tricky. We have created a transparent platform for the foreigners, where they can be informed face-to-face, to prevent them from having problems outside. This way,

we have implemented the open-door policy adopted by the government in our very own directorate.

In terms of technical issues, law no. 6458 constitutes our main basis. We have been working as a unit dealing with regular migration. Foreigners coming from countries with visa liberalization, who will be staying in Turkey for longer than 90 days, are required to obtain a residence permit. First of all, the law stipulates the following rule on the residence of foreigners: They need to apply from the country of which they are a national or where they lawfully reside; however, right now we are accepting applications for residence from within Turkey, as well. Any foreigner can visit our web site goc.gov.tr, click on the residence permit section and submit their application and make an appointment.

The foreigners then visit our directorate in line with their appointment requests. Afterwards, they can lawfully stay in Turkey with the application documents issued by our party until their relevant card is delivered to them by the General Directorate of Migration Management. Residence Permit Types can be grouped as follows:

- Short-term residence permit
- Family residence permit
- Long-term residence permit
- Student residence permit
- Humanitarian residence permit
- Residence permit for victims of human trafficking.

Panellist

İsmail Yıldırım

Ankara Provincial Directorate of the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services

Temporary Protection Regulation no. 29153 dated 22.10.2014 as was previously issued by the Ministry of Interior was amended with the official gazette no. 11208 dated 16.03.2018. Within the scope of the amendments made in 2018: The following provisions have been included in Article 30, Paragraph 1: Social Assistance; Paragraph 2: Psycho-Social Support Services; Paragraph 3: Unaccompanied Children; Paragraph 4: Home visits for determination of psycho-social requirements and Paragraph 5: Working with the NGOs in the field of PSS.

Within the scope of this regulation, social services and aids to be made available to people with special needs within and out of temporary accommodation centers and the psycho-social support that will be provided shall be carried out under the control and responsibility of the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services. Principles and procedures concerning the works and procedures performed shall be determined by the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services.

Home visits aimed at establishing the psycho-social requirements of people with special needs living within and out of the temporary accommodation centers shall be carried out in ac-

cordance with the principles and procedures to be designated by the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services.

Monitoring and control of the psycho-social support services planned to be provided by international and national non-governmental organizations within and out of the temporary accommodation centers shall be regulated in accordance with the principles and procedures to be designated by the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services.

Within the scope of the psycho-social support services provided via the Provincial Directorates and Social Service Centers;

- Field scanning and home visits are carried out through our professionals working at the Social Service Centers and Provincial Directorates.
- Within the scope of the psycho-social support services, the necessary individual interviews by identifying the social and psychological problems of individuals and families
- Guidance and counseling services and individual interviews, as well as group interviews, are also carried out.
- Social support services are arranged for children, women, the disabled, the elderly and adults, with priority being placed on vulnerable groups.
- Counseling and guidance efforts aimed at speeding up access to the required services are carried out.

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Family, Labor and Social Services provided services for 21,737 Syrians under temporary

protection in 2018. Services were provided for 9,553 Syrians under temporary protection in the period between January and May 2019.

Besides, awareness-raising trainings on topics such as “Forced Marriage At an Early Age”, “Child Abuse and Neglect”, “Gender Equality”, “Living Skills in Harmony with Cultural Differences”, “Information to Facilitate Life in the Province We Live” and “Hygiene Education” are arranged for individuals and families through the SSCs.

Looking at the services for children:

- They can benefit from Child Support Centers and other care organizations under the Ministry,
- They are supported within a foster family,
- Socio-economic support (as protective and preventive)
- Making field scans for Syrian children who are in need of protection and identifying the needs,
- Services for women are as follows; they can benefit from the services of female guest house and Violence Prevention and Monitoring Centers aimed at women who are victims of violence against women and domestic violence and whose security of life is at risk,
- Information about human trafficking, forced marriage at an early age, violence, etc. (brochures for beneficiaries, the public and NGOs)

Moderator

Metin Çorabatır

President of the Research Centre on Asylum and Migration

The presentations up till now demonstrate that the public institutions show great effort on the subject. However, the dimensions of the phenomenon are great. We are hosting more than 4 million refugees. This comes with great challenges. In fact, all areas are actually connected with harmonization

Panellist

Dr. Fulya Memişoğlu

Yıldız Technical University

We need to reflect on what the topics such as the successful harmonization process specific to Turkey mean, what kind of implementations and policies could be developed to meet the local needs, etc. The concept of harmonization has many different definitions in the academic literature. However, the generally acknowledged view nowadays is that harmonization/integration is not a one-sided process; it is reciprocal. Another issue that needs consideration is that harmonization takes place locally. Studies focusing on the experiences of different countries in this field show that although the po-

licies implemented at the national level direct the harmonization process, the experience of living together in the local area plays as much a decisive role.

We can shape our harmonization framework in compliance with the local needs similar to the integration model created by Alastair Ager and Alison Strang on the basis of England as an example. In the case of Ager and Strang’s model, the right to employment is identified as a basic tool for a successful harmonization process. A refugee must first of all have the right to employment in order to become self-sufficient in social and economic terms, start a new life by gaining trust and a sense of belonging, improve his/her language skills and learn a new profession.



The most discussed issue in Ager and Strang's model is the issue of rights and citizenship that are regarded as the basis of the harmonization process. That's because issues such as citizenship do not have a unique model that is applicable to all countries; it is shaped within the framework of the countries' own laws and national identity definitions.

So, what is the opinion of the migrants that are primarily affected by this situation? Today I would like to briefly discuss the findings of the project on local development-sensitive migration policies, in which I took part last year (SIDEM- ICMPPD). The migrant group we interviewed constituted a large sample, and almost all interviewees were employed formally or informally. The interviewees stated that having equal rights in socio-economic life and avoiding discrimination for being a foreigner was more important to them than citizenship. Furthermore, it should be noted that when we say migrants, we are not talking about a homogeneous group. This is true in socio-economic terms, as well. Needs-based approaches should be taken into account when determining policies. A common result we obtained as a result of the interviews we held was that the

employed persons somehow felt harmonization with Turkey. The statement "I work in this country and therefore I feel I belong in this country" was common. Another finding of the study is that the ratio of migrant women working formally was low, and this issue needs consideration because the female-male ratio in the migrant group at the working age is almost equal. As a country, our aim is to increase registered employment as much as possible and policies are being developed in this direction. However, we have seen that informal employment among the migrants is internalized. They need information about what rights they will have if they switch to registered employment. The same kind of information must be provided to locals and employers, as well. The interviewees we could group as entrepreneurs to start business easily in order to improve their belonging. In short, I am of the opinion that development-oriented migration policies based on the needs should be prioritized to address the issues of employment and harmonization together. Lastly, harmonization policies involve many actors, but the works carried out in this direction should not only include foreigners but also -and necessarily- local people, as well.

PANEL 2: THE IMPORTANCE OF TURKISH LANGUAGE AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING IN THE FRAMEWORK OF SOCIAL HARMONIZATION: SUSTAINABILITY OF EMPLOYMENT

Keynote:

Sevgi Cansu, *Ministry of Education, Lifelong Learning, Migration and Emergency Dep.*

Moderator:

Tuğba Uylaş, *Ankara PDMM, Head of the Working Group for Harmony and Communication*

Panellists:

Damla Taşkın, *UNHCR Livelihoods Officer*

Mehmet Buğra Kazanç, *Turkish Employment Agency, Employment Expert*

Saskia Baas, *Durable Solutions Platform*



Keynote

Sevgi Cansu

Head of the Department for Lifelong Learning, Ministry of National Education

The migration phenomenon is indeed not only a physical movement from one place to another; it also affects all processes of the society in terms of social, political, economic and cultural aspects. All kinds of interaction between the immigrants and the people living in areas receiving migration constitute components of migration. Especially after the civil wars in Syria and Iraq, Turkey has been exposed to intense migration flow. Pain has no religion, language or race. This is because the subject of migration is humankind and starting from this point of view, 4.1 million refugees live in our country. Important studies have been carried out in our country to decrease the psychological effect caused by the war on the people who migrated to our country after meeting their basic requirements. In this context, the educational institutions have more duties and responsibilities.

The Ministry of National Education (MoNE) has fulfilled its duty in this respect and has started the studies for ensuring education of the Syrian children in our country from the first day of the mass migration influx.

Our Ministry considers education for the Syrian children not as a basic right only but also as a vital subject in terms of recovery of them from the hard period they are experiencing and shaping of their own futures.

With the educational services it provides to the Syrian citizens who are under temporary protection in Turkey, the Ministry of National Education aims to ensure that the Syrian children will not be a lost generation and they will be able to create a good future for themselves.

The education to be received by these people in our country has a leading role in ensuring their

harmonization with our country and society and providing them with new opportunities.

The essential target of MoNE is to ensure that all of these children get access to education within the shortest time and to ensure schooling and to enable the education of them in the same conditions and quality of the Turkish students in order to minimize the number of lost generations.

Within this framework, 643,058 school-aged Syrian children (61.39%) have been included in education in our schools.

As in formal education, our Ministry has also determined informal education planning studies and road maps for language learning and improvement of personal and vocational skills of Syrian adults in an environment where they feel safe for themselves and their family. At this point, the "Migration and Emergency Education Department" has been established within the Directorate General for Lifelong Learning as the first thing to do.

The Directorate General for Lifelong Learning in MoNE, which has undertaken a significant duty in adult learning, incorporates 993 ea. public education centers and 3487 ea. training modules in hundreds of different fields to be provided in these public education centers. Until now, in total, 35,367,786 people have been provided with educational opportunities at these centers considering different age groups and regional requirements.

These institutions, to which especially women and disadvantaged groups have easy access too and where these people can receive information and education in any field they require, have undertaken an important role in education of the Syrian adults as well.

At the public education centers which have a key role in social harmonization and integration process, courses in hundreds of fields, especially in Turkish language teaching, have been organized for young and adult Syrians and their participation in vocational skill and hobby courses has been ensured.

In this way, it is aimed to ensure that they have the qualifications required for an income that may meet their daily requirements and they recover from the severe trauma they are suffering and revive.

582,402 Syrians have participated in the general and vocational courses organized in the public education centers, studies have also been carried out at both the public education and the vocational education centers for increasing participation to Vocational education.

In this year, "Social Harmonization Module" has been prepared with the cooperation of MoNE Directorate General for Lifelong Learning and the Directorate General for Migration Management.

Education of the Syrian citizens is the critical element for preventing lost generations, providing them with the information and skills required for making their own lives and for maintaining presence of hope today and in the future. In this context, Turkish language teaching has become an important title upon arrival of the Syrians. Turkey, for the first time, has had to provide Turkish language education for such a big number of "foreigners".

Under this scope, the plan for "Turkish Language Teaching for Foreigners" based on age groups has been prepared at the public educa-

tion centers for Turkish language teaching.

At this point, teaching Turkish as a foreign language means not only the Turkish language learning of a person but also the learning of Turkish culture as well as the lifestyle, mentality and perspective of Turkish people.

At the same time, for Syrians, Turkish learning means the ability of expressing themselves and their feelings, opinions and expectations and this is effective for seeing the similarities and accepting the differences in the social harmonization process.

Besides, sustainability of employment may be possible through;

- Vocational education to be provided considering regional differences and requirements
- Cooperation of all the institutions and organizations in the region
- Guiding the students towards the vocational schools
- Preparation of the environments required for the interaction of Turkish and Syrian citizens
- Ensuring the acceptance and support of the host societies in relation to the process
- Inclusion of the existing labor potential in production
- Preparation of law and regulations



Panellist

Damla Taşkın

UNHCR Livelihoods Officer

UNHCR is an international organization that was founded by the General Assembly of the UN on the 14th of December 1950 as a global refugee organization. This duty was given within the scope of the “Geneva Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees” (Article 35) which was accepted by UN in 1951 and which has become the essential document for the law on refugees.

The main duty of UNHCR is to do the following for the persons within its realm of authority:

- providing international protection and aid on human basis without political aspects,
- searching for permanent solutions for these people.

I believe in the importance of development. It is also not possible to consider the migration phenomenon independent from development. The development strategy of Turkey is to be the design and production base of Afro-Eurasia in terms of medium-high and high technology products.

Today, there are 469,419 open positions in the labor market of Turkey. We take value chain into consideration and focus on the sectors in which added value is created in Turkey. Unemployment is at a high level in Turkey, however an important employment gap also seems present. Especially in the manufacturing sector, there is a big gap and today the Syrian refugees close the gap. Textile is at the top of these sectors; especially the necessity for sewing machine operators is at a considerably high level; being aware of such employment gaps is critical for determining our programs.

There are many public institutions which we collaborate with in Turkey. Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services, TurkStat, MoNE, Directorate General for Migration Management and municipalities are some of these institu-

tions. On the other hand, we collaborate with the NGOs on site and carry out collaborative works with the private sector in relation to employment. This is because one of the most important actors generating employment is the private sector.

We primarily start with language teaching and then proceed with vocational education. Afterwards, we provide skill development trainings and İŞKUR also supports us at this stage.

Our activities in language teaching are as the following;

- Over 6000 persons have been reached since 2016 through language trainings.
- Access to the labor market and social harmonization has been supported.
- A1, A2, B1 level Turkish language trainings have been provided.
- Business English and terminology trainings have been provided.

With regard to Vocational Education;

- Over 10,000 persons have been reached since 2016.
- Trainings have been organized in the textile, automotive, agriculture, marketing, design, manufacture and service sectors.
- Trainings have been organized in the İstanbul, Ankara, İzmir, Bursa, Manisa, Gaziantep, Kilis, Şanlıurfa, Mardin, Mersin, Hatay and Van provinces.

With regard to skill development;

- CV (curriculum vitae) preparation, interview techniques, sales and marketing and career expositions have been organized.

With regard to supporting of access to labor market;

- Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services – Advocacy, information, work permit supports have been provided.
- İŞKUR – Registration, information services have been provided.
- Vocational Qualifications Authority – Translation of National Qualifications and Vocational Standards and certification support have been provided.

We, as UNHCR, have been working in various fields both to ensure the development of Turkey

and to make sure that people under our mandate can stand on their own two feet.

Panellist

Mehmet Buğra Kazanç

*Directorate General of Turkish
Employment Agency,
Employment Expert*

Due to its geographical location, Turkey is both in the position of a transit country and it has become a destination country for immigrants as it is more developed, and it has better social and economic conditions in comparison to the countries around Turkey. With over 4 million refugees who are its guest, Turkey is in the position of the country hosting maximum number of refugees around the world. In the prewar period, Syria was a country which was generally known as an agriculture country. In addition, textile and limited number of mining activities were also carried out. It would be very difficult for a Syrian person, who was working in agriculture sector in Syria, to find a job in agricultural sector when he/she arrives to Ankara. At this point, the importance of vocational education is revealed. It is critically important to identify the vocational necessities in Turkey and to provide trainings to the persons accordingly. In this way, the people could be given qualifications suitable for the labor market dynamics and they could find jobs more easily. However, there is an important obstacle here for the Syrians. These people should

be provided with language training at a level sufficient to give them vocational education. Although İŞKUR was founded in 1946, it has not provided language training from its foundation date up to now. However, this situation changed with the Syrian crisis. We aim to provide language training within the framework of our projects and these trainings are definitely very important for us. One of the leading studies among the studies we have made in this field is the Employment Support Project which we have been carrying out with the World Bank. Within the scope of this project; language trainings will be provided for Syrians in the İstanbul, Adana, Gaziantep and Şanlıurfa pilot provinces and a protocol was signed with TÖMER for the courses to be provided by TÖMER. The trainings were started in Şanlıurfa with a limited group. We aim to provide nearly 3.350 people with language training. The second step will be to provide people with correct occupation. For this purpose, we will give work practice and vocational information to the people through skill training courses and practical training courses. With these two programs, we plan to reach more than 15,000 people approximately. In addition, the employer has to employ up to thirty percent of our trainees that are graduated from the courses, for a period equal to the course period and this is expected to positively contribute to the employment.

Panellist

Saskia Baas

Durable Solutions Platform

I just arrived to Ankara after a visit to Lebanon and I would like to share some insights from my travel there. The situation in Lebanon is quite a lot more complex compared with Turkey. In Lebanon, Syrians have no legal status, and overall live in very poor shelter conditions in extreme poverty. It is also impossible for them to work in Lebanon or set up businesses. In this respect, it is truly hopeful to see the efforts made by the Turkish authorities, who took a different approach from the start of the refugee crisis, enabling refugees to work and to establish businesses and to contribute to the Turkish economy. I hope that my Turkish colleagues and experts in this room will work with us to spread these good examples to other countries in the region. There's a lot to be learned from the examples presented in this conference and Turkey's approach towards these issues.

In our research, we've found that there are still some difficulties for the Syrians seeking em-

ployment in existing companies and for entrepreneurs wishing to set up business in Turkey. We found that Turkish language is an important difficulty in finding a job and participating in business life. When we interviewed Syrian refugees and Turkish employers, we found that not understanding the Turkish language often meant not understanding the rules and regulations. To establish a business in Turkey for the Syrians, much more complicated than setting up a business in Syria. Understanding the system is not only about understanding language but also about understanding culture. Mastering the rules and regulations really requires knowing the language of that country. We have seen that it is a great obstacle for a person not to speak that language, and a great opportunity for him to speak. In addition, knowing the Turkish language helps to prevent exploitation in business life for working Syrians. In this way, employees can talk to their employers and manage their problems. As a result, our research with IGAM revealed that language is an extremely important component of social harmonization and an important factor for successful economic participation.

PANEL 3: UNIVERSITY GRADUATES AND FOREIGNERS WITH PROFESSIONS & FOREIGN GRADUATES FROM TURKISH UNIVERSITIES AND THEIR ACCESS TO THE LABOUR MARKET

Keynote:

Dr. Matthias Schulze-Böing, *Offenbach Municipality*

Moderator:

Assoc. Prof. Can Ünver, *Vice President of the UN Committee for Migration Workers*

Panellists:

Assoc. Prof. Mahmut Kaya, *Şanlıurfa Harran University*

Assoc. Başak Yavçan, *TOBB University of Economics and Technology*

Ece Yilmaztürk, *Director of Ankara Kızılay Community Centre*



Keynote

Dr. Matthias Schulze-Böing

Offenbach Municipality

It is a great pleasure for me to address you all. For a long time, I have been following up on what has been done in terms of the migration problem and the refugee crisis in Turkey and from a German perspective, Turkey deserves great respect and congratulations with its performance and achievements in this field, so far. Germany hosts the highest number of refugees with 1.1 million among the developed countries. However, Turkey hosts 4 million. It shows that the challenges in Turkey are much bigger than Germany. Generosity, pragmatism and rationality of Turkey could, in a way, set an example for Germany. As you know, legal regulations and perfectionism are the main priorities for the approaches of Germany in the field of integration. However, it would be reasonable to adopt some part of flexibility and pragmatism that I have observed in the applications in Turkey in order to make integration policies more efficient and effective. We are happy to have engaged in cooperation with IGAM in some projects. We have learnt how Turkey managed to cope with the problems concerning the harmonization of refugees with the Turkish community and economy not only with its public institutions but also with NGOs.

My presentation will touch upon general issues, and focus especially on employment in this area as a part of the harmonization management. First of all, participation of migrants to economy and their sufficiency in terms of economy are the keys to their harmonization to the host community, as well as guaranteeing their acceptance to citizenship. However, it might take quite a long time for the migrants to achieve full economic harmonization. According to the estimates by OECD, full harmonization of refugees and migrants to the labor market of the developed countries might take 5 years or longer. This pe-

riod can be rather lengthy for the migrants and their families, as well as the host communities. Long term economic inactivity, monetary loss of the tax-payers, decrease in human capital can be observed, and at the same time co-existence with refugees might result in a loss of motivation. As a result, more effort must be exerted to reinforce approaches to accelerate employment and harmonization processes.

I would like to present a brief summary of a harmonization management approach that we developed within the scope of an EU-supported international project to which IGAM is a partner. We have analyzed the policies applied and the services provided. We wholeheartedly believe that migrants must be one of the actors and collaborators of the harmonization process. In terms of the potential of the NGOs, partnership of the public services and private service providers should be taken into consideration so that the migrants do not forget about their own organizations. Therefore, partnership and network management are the key points for the good practices in harmonization policies. Taking a closer look into the conditions and the context of specific actions at the local level must be considered core achievement criteria, as well. Local and content-sensitive strategies will yield better results rather than a “uniform, the same for all” approach.

In brief, accelerating harmonization process is closely related with the following:

- Optimization of the harmonization process,
- Review and re-initiation of policies and services,
- Multi-faceted strategy, evaluation of policies, service provision, self-organization and civil society potential,
- Implementation of time-based management forms (Acceleration Management, Critical Path Method, etc.)

Our harmonization strategy is as follows:

- Process optimization and simultaneous implementation of different activities for harmonization (such as language teaching, business

skills teaching and work practice). These activities may be organized not consecutively but simultaneously in a parallel manner.

- Product innovation, for example language and skills teaching, computer-based learning and soon enough, mixed methods for computer-based coaching and guidance.
- Joint construction – for example, migrants to take an active role in taking precautions at the local level, and designing, executing and evaluation of harmonization policies with a wider extent (to adopt the elements of a “design idea” which has been quite popular

lately, as a method of accelerating product innovation and development in the private sector)

- And capacity development include the areas that we focus on. It means that we need to consider our personnel and management “time-wise”, and in this regard, we need to develop policies, overcome the silo logics and be open to social innovation, and rapidly-changing service designs.

This is a brief summary of our ideas and operations. Thank you.

Moderator

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Can Ünver

Vice President of UN Committee for Migrant Workers

Thank you very much dear Dr. Schulze-Böing. First of all, I would like to thank IGAM and the organizations that have contributed to this meeting. Before starting, I would like to say a few words. I have been studying on migration for nearly forty years. My first study at Munich University was about the Turkish workers in Germany. These studies have been my job for a very long time. I have taken office as a labor attaché for many times in my bureaucratic life. Then, I become interested in the academic side of the subject. Recently, I also have a duty at the UN. As a result of our liberal visa policy since 1990s, Turkey has become a target in migration influxes for transit pass and settlement purposes. After 2011, we witnessed arrival of a significant number of people to our country survivors of the so-called Arab Spring. Meanwhile, I think that a very pleasing development occurred. Today, as we can see, there is a dynamic discussion environment here. Our migration related

institutions have experienced a learning and restructuring process in the recent years and they are still in a process open to development. We are also proud of them. At the same time, a very dynamic civil society environment has also arisen. There are migration researches centers in 25 universities in our country. We have recently founded the twenty sixth one at İstanbul Ayyıldız University. Therefore, this situation concerns both the Academia and the public institutions very closely. We have evaluated this integration issue somewhat differently and this is very good. We see that a concept, which is not established on cultural disintegration and differences, but rather a concept which will ensure harmonization of the people with the society through employment has been developed. We attach importance to harmonization, but a right-based approach should always be in the foreground. Turkey is becoming a country which sets norms and standards on migration. Turkey has had experiences since 1930 regarding utilization of trained and skilled human power. Great persons, who escaped from German Nazism and invited by Atatürk to Turkey with the attempt of Albert Einstein, contributed to establishment and development of universities in Turkey until the end of World War II.

Therefore, we are well-informed on benefiting from this. Also, in the current period, I believe that both the people being educated in Turkey and the people arriving as trained labor force would contribute at all points economically. But I would like to highlight that we should pay special attention for being rightful while looking after our own interests. This is for human dignity and among our international commitments.

Thank you very much for listening. Now I would like to introduce my colleagues. 2 estimable academicians are here. Assoc. Prof.

Dr. Mahmut Kaya is a member of Harran University which is one of the most important universities of the region. My dear friend Assoc. Prof. Dr. Başak Yavçan is a member of TOBB Economy and Technology University. She is also a reputable academician in Turkey in relation to migration issues. Ece Yılmaztürk is the director of Ankara Red Crescent Community Center. We know that the Red Crescent has covered a considerable distance together with the other institutions in this respect. Now I would like to give the floor to Mr. Mahmut Kaya.

Panellist

Assoc. Prof. Mahmut Kaya

Şanlıurfa Harran University

I would like to thank all the institutions, which are the stakeholders of this conference, for their efforts. I will try to describe the problems experienced by the Syrian refugees by telling about my field experiences and the in-depth interviews I have made primarily in Şanlıurfa and somewhat in Gaziantep in relation to the access of the university graduate students and the refugees having a profession to employment. Business and economy are an important field highlighted across the whole integration literature. Set-up of a business by a refugee, his/her recovery from poverty is very important in terms of harmonization. We know that working is also a rehabilitation for people to recover from the postwar traumas. We could specify four main elements that affect the Syrian refugees in integration to business and employment:

1. General structure of the Syrian refugees in Turkey: This varies according to the provinces and regions. Factors that affect harmonization through employment such as the educational-cultural levels, work skills of the refugees and their gender rates; child-adult, man-woman, elderly-young rates.

2. The capacity, distribution of employment and sectors and unemployment rates in the cities where the refugees have settled in.
3. Legislation regulating the work conditions.
4. The current economic structure of the country, inflation, unemployment and foreign exchange fluctuations.

Within these four main frameworks, I would like to mention the data I have compiled directly from the interviews with the Syrians from field visits. The essential problem among both the university students and the persons having a profession is the legislation and equivalence problem. For the persons who have qualified professions, for example a lawyer, to be able to work in Turkey, his/her lawyer certificate needs to be approved by the authorities of the Republic of Turkey, otherwise he/she is not permitted to work. Status of the business fields has also an important role. Şanlıurfa is a city where the agriculture, construction and service sectors are at a high level and the industrial sector is at a low level. Gaziantep is just beside Şanlıurfa. Since it is an industry city, the refugees living there have somewhat more advantage. By the way Şanlıurfa is a city where the biggest number of refugees live, following İstanbul; there are nearly 460 thousand refugees in its frontier zone. Another problem is that the persons

with qualified professions cannot find a job. For example, I know a lawyer; he is working at a factory in return for subsistence wage. The subsistence wage is not 2020 TL; it is 1600 TL which is specific for the Syrians. He was a very reputable lawyer in Syria and now he is working at a factory for 1600 TL. The persons at the middle and lower profession group can find jobs relatively easy. However, qualified professional groups such as engineers, lawyers and dentists have extreme difficulty in finding a job. Being unable to speak Turkish sufficiently is an important factor. The applications for work permits take a long time in addition this the bureaucratic procedures are very longwinded and tiresome, which results in low numbers of applications. Moreover, unregistered employment and shadow businesses occur naturally. Interestingly, however, new areas of employment are emerging. International organizations and national associations, in particular the United Nations and its stakeholders, have turned out as areas of employment. Particularly people speaking more than one language are employed there. Those who are unable to find work in their own respective fields are employed there as translators, assistants, field workers or coordinators since they are able to speak a language. Healthcare centers can also turn out as work areas for refugees; i.e., the doctors are employed there. As a distinguishing feature, one factors preventing employment of the Syrians in Turkey is the economic crisis in Turkey. High rates of inflation and the currency fluctuations have impacted the Syrians as well. They are impacted in terms of finding work, dismissals, decreased purchasing power and becoming impoverished. For students and professionals, age and gender are the decisive factors. The employers seek to employ a certain age group among the Syrians. There is an association in Şanlıurfa called 'Rızık İstihdam Ofisi' (Employment Office for Livelihood) functioning as İŞKUR (Turkish Employment Agency) for Syrians which has acted as an intermediary for the employment

of 18,000 people up to now. According to their data, people aged between 18-28 are preferred for employment. In particular, the group aged 40 and over and the people who are members of a qualified profession cannot find work. Generally young women are able to find work. The risks for women that are over a certain age and widowed and the women who lack social support mechanisms are very different. Young girls who are able to speak a language and are educated are more easily employed. On the other hand, employment is largely unregistered. Effort has been made to render it more registered compared to the previous years. The legal basis was formed on the basis of Directive on Work Permit of Foreigners with Temporary Protection no. 6575 dated 2016. However, unregistered employment has interesting outcomes. For instance; the fear of losing social assistance leads to employment with long working hours for a low fee. Another outcome of unregistered employment is the usurpation of fee.

Prejudice is another basic problem. Although harmonization is somewhat strong in Şanlıurfa, there is still some prejudice against the Syrians. It turns out as a problem in terms of the hiring and employment of the Syrians. Due to the bureaucratic obstacles and the prolonged procedures that I just mentioned, there are sectors developing as unregistered ones. For instance, hairdressing, particularly hairdressing for women, is more common among the Syrians.

The relevant institution in Gaziantep does not allow employment of a hairdresser holding an official certificate -although there are no legal problems- so as not to narrow down the market. On the other hand, this work gets to be done as a mobile service. Doctors, hairdressers, etc. in Şanlıurfa find a chance to perform their profession in their own home or by being invited to the home of other people. Mobile Wi-Fi application has emerged as a new sector. In neighborhoods where the infrastructure is not available in the border regions, some people set up a station and sell internet through wireless

network and make a good income out of it. Besides, there is the issue of labor migration performed by migrants seasonally and temporarily among themselves. Due to high level of unemployment in Şanlıurfa, there is a work-related migration to other cities. In contrast, due to the fact that Şanlıurfa is no stranger to Syria in terms of culture, people can choose to live in Şanlıurfa with poverty that is just enough to put bread on the table, in order not to stay away from their familiar cultural environment. There are problems arising from the working conditions. Discrimination and abuse can occur, especially among the female workers. There are certain criteria to receive citizenship. Citizenship procedures of persons who work under insurance for a certain period of time may take less time. For this reason, there may be people wishing to accelerate their citizenship procedures by paying the insurance premium to the employer without going to work. In the end,

there is actually a very simple solution: Work environments where the refugees can exist with their own language, religion, identity and gender need to be established and their security must be ensured. Legal texts and bureaucratic procedures must be transformed into a structure that will facilitate harmonization. Inspection in border areas is very poor. This paves the way for plenty of abuse. Inspections should be made more frequent in all areas and the rights should be protected. The refugee population in border provinces is very high; a fair distribution of load must be ensured. The workforce is too much, and the employment area is insufficient; the labor force especially in the border regions can be distributed to other industrial cities. Institutions and organizations carrying out projects related to refugees should turn to employment- and production-oriented projects. These are the remedies that will alleviate problems. Thank you for listening patiently.



Panellist

Assoc. Prof. Başak Yavçan

TOBB University of Economics and Technology

Hello all, first of all I would like to thank you for this nice event. Despite all our activities, we are still encountered with great problems in terms of integration with labor markets.

Around 40 thousand Syrian refugees have received work permits; however, it is estimated that around 1 million people are non-registered workers. As I discuss the subject, I will focus on the integration to education. I will talk about some studies; however, there are two studies that I largely conduct with the university students. One of them is our joint study with the American University of Beirut which is about further access and attendance to school

Here, I will touch upon the reflection of the equivalence processes in the universities and schools, which was discussed before in terms of vocations. Secondly and largely, I will talk about a study that we carry out in cooperation with Prof. Dr. Murat Erdoğan. I will rather evaluate the perceptions on university education, expectations for the future and the attitudes towards living in Turkey among the Syrian academicians and university students. Noting that generally 200 Syrian academicians are studying in Turkey, I will rather focus on the students. Education is very important as a target of harmonization. Basic education, primary, secondary, high school and university education constitute a social and economic harmonization framework for us, by creating a middle-class model at the same time. Especially looking at the example of university students, these students are in a significant position for establishing communication with the university students from the local community and setting an example for the individuals from their own group. Conducted studies show that the contact between the groups is important in terms of decreasing prejudice and increasing social harmonization. However, it is not any contact but the contact that takes place at equal level, which is significant. Being seated on the same seats, attending to the conference or taking a lecture is a harmonization relationship at the same level. Unfortunately, when we call someone to fix something at home, it does not create similar results for social harmonization, since it is not a contact at the same class level.

Syrian refugees have a schooling ratio of about 62% in the primary education. When this ratio is compared to the initial years of the crisis, it shows that a significant progress has been made. However, there is a critical situation for us. Although we have achieved a schooling of 62-63%, there is a serious decline in schooling ratio from grade 4 of the primary education. We observe that it is a problem for us to feed into the university.

Looking at the profile of the university students in Turkey, almost half of them have already studied at a university in Syria and are studying again in Turkey. Looking at the Syrians at higher education, the achievement made in access to the basic education, this achievement is a model application in which there are exemptions from tuition fees and university education funds from different institutions to 20-25% of these students. In general, 27,000 students study at various universities in Turkey in 2018-2019 academic year.

There are programs which provide education in Arabic, as well as those in Turkish especially in the regional universities. In this respect, in terms of schooling ratio there are obstacles for Syrians to attend the university or to the high school before that. According to some focus groups in a different study that I conducted; child labor is the reason why. Since the parents receive a lower wage, children need to work at the secondary or high school age, even before they come to the university level. Also, university education is not economically easy. Although the tuition fee is not paid, it is an education that needs to be supported financially. If the student is studying in a different province, economic situation is yet again a significant variable. A critical aspect that stands out when we talk to the Syrian academicians is that, although the academicians have specialized in different majors like history or geography, they have been appointed to Arabic Language and Literature or Theology as they are fluent in Arabic. In parallel, we can see that the students cannot study in the majors they want to. We see that most of them cannot always study the majors they want to due to their performance at the university entrance exams and foreign student exams; they study at the departments with a higher quota, instead.

Now I would like to continue with the results of Elite Dialogue survey concerning university students that we performed in the last months of 2018. There are eligible scholarship

programs for university students. However, the ratio of those receiving scholarship declines significantly, despite some increase in the number of those who benefit from the programs as the number of university students increases. We can see that almost half of the university students need to work full-time or part-time to sustain their living.

Another characteristic of the Syrian university students is that they are extremely vulnerable. Its first aspect is economic vulnerability. Although they used to have a significantly higher wage when they lived in Syria, we observe that there is a serious decline in their income as they come to Turkey. The only positive and pleasant point is that university students have more positive expectations from life, maybe because they are students. However, majority of students think that they cannot find a job after graduation or they will work in unqualified labor force. When we think about the issue of university students' returning to Syria, there is relatively more positive social approach towards their stay, since they constitute an educated community. Looking at what the university students think about it, we can see that there are particular conditions for leaving and staying. The rate of those who say "I will never go back" increased from 26-27% to 34% in two years. The rate of those who say "I will go back no matter what" decreased from 11% to 5%.

When asked if they are interested in placement in a third country, almost 50% say that they would like to go to another country under different conditions. They say that they would do that if their education is discontinued or if they cannot find a job. Looking at the countries they would prefer, Gulf countries are more apparent now, most probably because of the decreased possibility of placement in Western countries.

When they are asked "What are your most critical problems?" – once again reminding that this group consists of Syrian university students – they have problems specifically representing their group, rather than basic needs. To them,

studying and working conditions are the most worrying problems. When asked about what kind of a status they would like in Turkey, we observe that the most popular one is double nationality. Then, we observed that the status of work permit that does not have any limitation (as an imaginary status), would be quite popular.

We can see that they do not present great social distance in terms of their relations with the local community with regards to social harmonization, which is our main point. Actually, the social distance of Turkish community from Syrians is much greater. Another significant point for harmonization is confidence in institutions. There is a tendency of increase in terms of confidence in institutions between the 1st and 2nd rounds of the survey. This is an interesting point and it is regarded as such all around the world. Migrants have more confidence in the institutions of the relevant country than the local community. It is particularly the case with refugees because they have a more positive view of the institutions that host them in their country of destination, since the institutions in their country of origin are in a poor condition.

We have carried out a more in-depth study on the social distance. Here, employment is a critical indicator. Social distance of those who work is much lower than those who don't. In other words, they are much less biased against local community. Here we can see that participation in employment has a great contribution to social harmonization.

Public diplomacy and citizenship represent yet another critical point. We expected that the Syrians who have become citizens would have more positive view of local community. However, the survey results were entirely contrary. Syrian students who have become citizens were more distant to local community. When we started to dig into the reason why, we found that there were personal stories that do not reflect to the figures. These stories mainly involved the situations in which a Syrian

university student shared the information that he/she became a Turkish citizen with a local and saw a much greater reaction. He/she tends to keep a larger social distance as a result of this reaction, most probably.

We observed that having scholarship had a similar effect. We realized that the students on scholarship were more faced with discrimination. That the details of scholarship conditions and the origin of funds are not shared, and the situation thereof is not very well described, cas-

es reactions based on realistic competition concerns. In conclusion, university students have serious concerns regarding harmonization, and their concerns are significant for us since they are make up the group which is the closest to harmonization. However, if progress is made in areas which require proper management the most, it seems that obtaining much more positive results can be possible. Thank you very much for patience.

Panellist

Ece Yilmaztürk

Ankara Kızılay Community Center

Director

Iwould like to thank the hosts of our conference on behalf of myself and the Turkish Red Crescent for their kind invitation.

We can take up the humanitarian aid operations for the Syrian crisis following the year 2011 in three periods. These can be summarized as, firstly, the services provided for the Syrians who crossed the border to come to Turkey in temporary accommodation areas, and then, activities carried out covering FRIT I (EU Financial Assistance Program for Refugees in Turkey) period for the harmonization of Syrians moved from camps to the urban areas, and the activities to be carried out in the upcoming FRIT II period, particularly concerning improving their sources of income and increasing their employment opportunity.

When we started with the humanitarian aid operations regarding the Syrian Crisis in 2011, people who came crossing the border were hosted in temporary accommodation areas. Later, in the recent years, the phenomenon of urban refugees has emerged as they moved to the cities. As a consequence, the harmonization of Syrians living in the cities started to be discussed. Today, as Turkish Red Crescent, we have 16

Community Centers in total. What do we do in these centers? Which services do we provide to whom? Generally, I will talk about these. The main objective of the Turkish Red Crescent Community-Based Migration Programs is to ensure the psychological, social and economic wellbeing of the Syrians under temporary protection outside the camp in Turkey, as well as foreigners with international protection status and the local community, to increase their social resilience and to carry out post-crisis assistance and development activities by ensuring the development of the culture of co-existence with the local community in social harmonization.

Target audience of the services of the Community Centers, as a priority, includes the vulnerable people such as the handicapped, the elderly, and the individuals who have been exposed to violence. Our Community Centers aim to bring their services to all those in need living in the region of their service area, regardless of their religion, language and race.

Four main programs are implemented under the Community Centers, which include Protection, Development of Source of Income, Social Harmonization, Health and Psycho-social Support Program. Here, I would like to focus on the program of the source of income. This program aims to improve the vocational capacities of those in need being under temporary protection and international protection in our country, as well as

the local community, and to increase their employability, and to support guidance towards employment and entrepreneurship in order to ensure their self-sufficiency. This program has reached out to 28,888 people so far. These include people who participated in the vocational and Turkish language courses, were guided towards employment and included in entrepreneurship programs. There are three main sub-programs of the development of source of income. These are guidance towards employment, entrepreneurship, farming and stock-breeding.

Talking about the guidance towards employment program, every employer expects employees to speak Turkish language at a certain level. At present, many people continue to Turkish language teaching throughout the day at any community center. It is ensured that the people contact with the employers in the region based on their previous vocational experience and knowledge with our profile creation and guidance towards employment activities. Vocational trainings are provided in areas that the market needs. Employers are supported with the payment of the work permit charges in order to make registered employment more appealing.

Separate groups attend to the tailoring course at our center in the morning and in the afternoon. Monthly contribution in kind of 15.000 TL can be made available to our course participants with the support to household production project. Many occasional activities are also carried out with our course participants in different parts of Ankara. For example, activity of clothing sewing has been performed for the students studying at a school identified in Polatlı, who were found to be in need of support, to wear during the ceremony of 23 April National Sovereignty and Children's Day, this year.

The hairdressing course in our center is yet another activity that we carry out with the Public Education center. Some of our course participants who were entitled to receive a certificate

for this course, and who graduated from this course in the previous years started to use a room in their places as a hairdresser saloon and contribute to the household income. In addition, our course participants occasionally visit the nursing centers for the elderly to support the individuals with their self-care.

Another project of ours for providing a source of income is "There Is Hope in the Kitchen" project. Project was launched 3 months ago. Training activities are ongoing with the participants who were identified as a result of the interviews made with the candidates. As a result of the cooking training provided to a total number of 60 people in two groups under the project carried out with the cooperation with WFP and WALD, course participants will also complete their probation stage and will be placed in a job. It will be ensured that the foreigners with an engineer or technician background achieve the qualifications as a SAP Counselor in areas that the clients and business partners of SAP Turkey need and that they are employed in appropriate firms, with our SAP counseling project which is yet to start.

Also, there are many foreigners who have graduated from the School of Law among those who apply to our community centers. We will have opened the path for these individuals who cannot perform their profession in Turkey due to the vocational equivalence condition, with our ECHO-supported and certificated "Judicial Operations" course, which we are yet to launch in Ankara, and is already operating in some community centers in different provinces of Turkey, so that they can work in the law offices and courthouses.

80 people will be provided training by means of our wood flooring, natural gas pipe laying, welding, automotive electrician's courses (in cooperation with MEKSA) and it is aimed to ensure 20% employment. In general, the period of employment of the people who start working may be shorter than expected due to the mismatch between the expectations of



the employees and employers although employment-guaranteed vocational training programs are implemented. Therefore, support programs for the individuals are implemented to develop social skills, in order to provide a solution to the problems which can be attributable to the curse participants.

Quite recently, our projects on farming and stockbreeding have accelerated in all parts of Turkey. Cooperation with the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry is ensured in order to provide theoretical and practical vocational training to the beneficiaries through the stakeholders in the provinces within the scope of the project, meet their material and equipment needs and enhance cooperation for the employment of the beneficiaries. For example, course participants from among the local community and Syrians are provided training on mushroom cultivation in Adana. We also have fresh fruit and vegetable growing course in Bursa, lavender growing courses in Mardin and medicinal and aromatic plant growing course in Şanlıurfa. It is aimed for the individuals who have vocational skills in a particular area but do not have an income

but developed vocational skills with the courses they participated, to generate income by means of household production and small-scale farming and stock-breeding activities.

We have started with a new program on entrepreneurship. Entrepreneurship trainings are started to be provided under this project which we will implement with TOBB ETÜ in 6 provinces. We have already received applications from Ankara that are quite higher than expected. 150 people to be identified will be provided entrepreneurship training from the basic level to advanced, and 10 people to be determined will be provided contribution in kind amounting to 50 thousand TL each, at the end of the training period. Later, they will also be provided incubation and mentorship support with the idea camps to be developed.

Before I end my words, I would like to mention our stakeholders and supporters. European Union, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Norwegian Red Cross, German Red Cross, UNCHR, UNICEF, IOM and WFP are the distinguished organizations that we work with.

PANEL 4: EMPLOYMENT ALTERNATIVES FOR FOREIGNERS LIVING IN TURKEY: ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND SOCIAL COOPERATIVES

Keynote:

Alexander Wolffhardt, *Migration Policy Group*

Moderator:

Dr. Nihal Eminoğlu, *Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University*

Panellists:

Sezai Hazır, *President of Habitat Association*

Hüseyin Ar, *Deputy Chairman of the Ankara Union of Tradesmen and Craftsmen Chamber*

Nilay Özlem Türkmen, *The Ministry of Commerce, GD of Social Cooperatives*

Hande Kara, *Ankara Development Agency*

Wahiba Chaker, *Ass. Chairwoman of TUGODER*



Keynote

Alexander Wolffhardt

Migration Policy Group (MPG)

Thank you so much. I'm going to talk about refugee entrepreneurship for a few minutes. But first of all, I want to touch on a slightly broader subject. The Migration Policy Group was invited here to provide views and information on monitoring and evaluation. First of all, I will give an overview of our monitoring and evaluation system for refugees and address specific issues related to this conference. Why do we need to follow the policy on integration of refugees? In European countries it is generally thought that; long-term integration is actually a long-term and sustainable solution to the benefits of international protection. The entire legal framework already exists. This legal framework is based on the idea that refugees will remain in the country of origin, and this long-term integration is considered in view of the fact that they will not return home once they have international protection. From the experience we have gained from previous migrations, the legal responsibilities of states or governments are to implement these integration policies. However, these integration policies are not easy to develop and implement. In this process, no country is perfect and of course a certain change of thought and perception is required. Whether it is a destination country or a transition country, this is a difficult issue. For this reason, it is very important to create a system and to make efforts, to eliminate the deficiencies and to collect certain evidence and improve the application. The National Integration Evaluation Mechanism (NIEM) monitors the quality of government policies for refugee integration. This system monitors what governments are doing, not the local area or non-governmental organizations. We measure policies and developments over 173 indicators. They can also be seen as a tool for policy makers to identify needs and

improve their policies. We will work together with our 14 research partners to contribute to national advocacy and agenda-building. We conduct a very thorough analysis. Our analysis; social-economic integration, housing, employment, vocational training, health, social security. These indicators also take into account legal integration, such as residence, access to citizenship, family unity.

We have steps to establish the legal framework. The first step is to establish the legal framework. Our first question is whether there are laws in place to apply the integration principles. Secondly, we are looking at whether there are policies to implement these principles. Then, are stakeholders involved in implementation and cooperation involved in the process and look at how we can increase the participation of refugees. Finally, we look at whether there is reliable data in the process of assessing the success of these policies. We have presented our first report on this research with the European Benchmark Criteria for Refugee Integration. This comprehensive analysis report covers refugees with different protection status in EU countries. There is a good balance between the 14 countries involved. We are looking at these three dimensions, which I have given comparatively by giving scores between 0-100. We look at what has changed in these countries during the next 2 years.

Today's main point is equal access to employment, and every country, like citizens, is granted equal access to free employment. Many countries require citizenship to work for the core administration of the state. Access to self-employment exists in many countries, but there are barriers to some self-employment. For example, in Romania, translators are required to be nationals; Some professions in France are considered to be professions that only European Union citizens can do. The equivalence of diplomas is a possibility provided by many countries. All measures require more active approaches and investment in the labour market.

Public employment services that can provide counselling to beneficiaries and job seekers exist in only 6 countries, and in 2 countries this service is implemented by non-governmental organizations.

Do central governments go down to local level, does it coordinate employment policies, are policies guided, these are important indicators of central coordination.



Panellist

Sezai Hazır

President of Habitat Association

First, we need to start with asking why entrepreneurship takes place. In this respect, it is essential to know the differences between opportunistic entrepreneurship, creative entrepreneurship and obligatory entrepreneurship. Syrian refugees can be dealt with under the category of obligatory entrepreneurship. In this case, entrepreneurship is regarded as a way out in order to survive in the host country and attain a certain living standard. Even if the war ends and Syrians return to their country one day, encouraging to entrepreneurship should not be avoided. When we think about a Syrian who is to go back and re-establish stability, thanks to the investments made today, a significant partner and foreign market will have been enhanced. In addition, it should be considered that the Syrians who stay in Turkey may continue contributing to Turkey in the upcoming periods as trained staff. Also, there may be losses in the vocational courses held for the Syrian ref-

ugees in Turkey. It should be assessed to what extent the courses serve their purpose and it is critically important to provide courses in specific areas that are needed in the labor market.

For Syrian refugees who would like to step into the business life, it is rather important to know about the Turkish legislation. Yet, we need to make a self-criticism here, as we may also have information gaps thereof. Especially the Ministry of Trade assumes a critical role in terms of providing correct, rapid and simple information. Furthermore, one of the barriers for Syrian refugees to embark in the business life and become entrepreneurs is the social aids that they depend on. If the individual gets a job (in case of formal-registered employment) and takes a step for entrepreneurship and even needs to apply for grant schemes for this aim, existing social aids will be discontinued and since he does not intend for it, he gives up on this plan or would like to keep receiving aid by unregistered and unlawful employment. I think this is the point that needs to be considered and requires a solution.

Panellist

Hüseyin Ar

Deputy Chairman of the Ankara Union of Tradesmen and Craftsmen Chambers

I am glad to be with you all. Actually, we are the addressee of the subjects discussed here. We are the ones to create employment. Entrepreneurship element based on the individual and individual value has been recently regarded as the main factor of economic development, creating employment and social development. We launched entrepreneurship trainings with practical application in the year 2016. We provided training to 720 entrepreneurs in groups of 24 as part of the trainings continued in the year 2017. We were happy to observe that 50% of the training participants were women. Almost 30% of 720 course trainees opened up their businesses.

Four important issues stand out in terms of the harmonization of people who migrated to our country for various reasons. These include the provision of accommodation, working life, education and health services. For us, it is import-

ant that the people who migrated to our country to open up their business and register to our chambers. We try to provide the education and counselling services that are required, as much as the facilities of our union can afford. There are 29 foreigners who opened up businesses and registered to the tradesmen registry of our union in July 2018. 15 out of them are Iraqi nationals and 7 are Afghan nationals. They usually operate in services sector. We observe that this figure increased to 103 one year later in June 2019. There has been increase of more than 3-fold. 45 of these foreigners are Iraqi nationals. Again, they generally operate in catering services.

We need to focus on vocational training in a co-operated manner in order to facilitate the harmonization of foreigners. This is also important for the economy of our province because the non-registered workers and non-registered workplaces in our province must be reduced to minimum. It is also significant for the sustainability of fighting against child labor.

On behalf of myself and my institution, I would like to thank all participants for listening.

Panellist

Nilay Özlem Türkmen

The Ministry of Commerce, GD of Social Cooperatives

It is observed that social cooperatives model that provides solution to the issues of ensuring integration of the disadvantaged groups to working life, as well as ensuring provision of social and semi-public services, and stands out by being open to the membership of volunteers, has become widespread in the last 50 years in developed and developing countries. Main element that distinguishes social cooperatives from other cooperatives is that they execute their operations for public benefit and they are non-profit organizations. Looking at their areas

of implementation, it is observed that social co-operative model is an outstanding commercial model in service provision of semi-public services, such as education and health, employment of disadvantaged groups, and service provision of care for the disabled, diseased, elderly and children.

Being an important model for the integration of the disadvantaged groups in economic life, social cooperatives stand out as a significant commercial model for the refugees and migrants to play a role in the economic life and for facilitating social harmonization. At present, social cooperatives are established based on the Law on Cooperatives no: 1163, just like the other types of cooperatives. According to the Law on Cooperatives, there is no obstacle for Syrian refugees or foreign nationals to be

partners of cooperatives. Only the members of the executive board or the supervisory board are required to be the citizens of the Republic of Turkey. Right now, there are examples of cooperatives in our country in which Syrian refugees also act as partners.

“Social Cooperative Training and Promotion Train” activity was held twice in October 2018 and April 2019 and study visits were organized

to 19 provinces in total, as part of the training and promotion activities of the ongoing Social Cooperative Promotion, Education, Application and Development Project. Temporary accommodation centers were visited in the provinces of Hatay and Gaziantep that were visited during the Spring trip that was held in April and activities were held on the basis of social cooperatives and solidarity for children in these centers.



Panellist

Hande Kara

Ankara Development Agency

Hello, briefly speaking, there are 26 agencies established under Development Agency generally in Turkey as part of the harmonization process to the European Union. As Ankara Development Agency, we believe that social development cannot be considered apart from economic development. These agencies were essentially established to ensure local development. As part of local development, we support associations with social responsibility platform for economic social development. We also have financial support programs. One of them will be for social entrepreneurship in the upcoming period. For us, social entrepreneurship is

important, considering that we need to provide solutions to common social problems so that people can work together for social harmonization. One model, or instrument for this is the social cooperative. Another instrument includes associations and the economic operations of the associations. We continue with the activities concerning social entrepreneurship. Social problems urge people to come up with innovative solutions. People overcome their problems by finding a solution to the problems that they encounter with their own structures and dynamics. In the upcoming period, agencies will be more active as part of our “FRIT” project so that we can support them. We support the entrepreneurs and we will try to ensure their integration with the existing structures accordingly. Thank you.

Panellist

Wahiba Chaker

Ass. Chairwoman of TUGODER

The concept of Temporary Protection has been introduced as the migration movements started from Syria. People under temporary protection are not included in the international legislation. As an individual who has suffered from the legitimization process of the owned status, I have closely witnessed the difficulty of the process that the people under temporary protection went through by the time they could get the yellow identity card. There has been a tremendous movement of migration to Turkey with the war situation in Syria. These people who have settled in many different provinces of Turkey with these migration movements constitute the area of interest for TUGODER.

TUGODER stands for the Association for Solidarity with Turkmen Migrants, Refugees and Asylum Seekers. As an association, we have made remarkable activities in these areas and we continue to make more and we are proud of obtaining fruitful results. As TUGODER, we have pioneered for socio-economic activities, cultural studies and social harmonization projects and we have organized both national and international workshops. As TUGODER, we have introduced various projects for the citizens immigrated from Syria and citizens living in Turkey.

8,500 engineers have the temporary protection status in Turkey. Since the diploma equivalence is not provided, it is not possible for the engineers to perform their occupational specialization. They work as construction workers. Required infrastructure and operations are already prepared for providing topography training within the scope of 'I am not unemployed, I am qualified staff' project for the engineers under temporary protection, and it will be imple-

mented if required funding, stakeholder and an appropriate university is found.

"I am not Begging, I am Earning and Making Others Earn" project for the housewives from the women under temporary protection and Turkish women have been declared within the scope of the social responsibility project of Ankara Development Agency, and we have already provided a training facility by means of donation. Cooking training is for 136 hours and pastry training is for 808 hours. As part of this project, which is within the scope of lifelong learning, our course participants are first given Turkish language course at A2 level and then they go through a rehabilitation and integration process with their Turkish peers and they are provided vocational training.

We have proudly pioneered the establishment of a migration health center for the Syrian doctors who came to Turkey with the migration movements, in partnership with the World Health Organization and the Republic of Turkey Ministry of Health.

"I See with My Knowledge" project aims to develop language skills among Syrian, Turkish and other refugee children who live in Turkey for the aim of providing translation-interpreting services for the handicapped under temporary protection. Also, we are making progress towards making multilingual cultural center available. Our target audience within this project include all students who have received secondary school, high school and foreign language education and we aim to provide language teaching for all students free of charge in order to support them.

Ongoing beekeeping project entitled "My Workplace, My Hive" to be implemented for the Syrian women under temporary protection and Turkish women within the scope of integration, will have been launched in 2019 whose project phases, approval and funding have been completed.

OPENING REMARKS OF DAY 2



Sibel Ergül

Ankara Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, Data Preparation and Control Operator

First of all, welcome. I would like to start with our purpose and activities as an institution regarding harmonization. Our country is hosting 4.8 million foreigners, 3.6 million of which are Syrians. Consequently, it makes harmonization with the community of foreigners living in the provinces and our country a must. There has been an ongoing war situation for 9 years and we have been hosting the victims of this war for 9 years. Now, it has become an obligation and a necessity to mix with each other, get to know about each other's culture and ensure harmonization for living together in peace and security. We work in a coordinated manner with many public institutions and organizations for ensuring harmonization. Here, the most critical element includes children and women, of course. As you know, women constitute the fundamental elements of the society. It is very important that women are in touch with the local

community- with us and our children. There are some certain prejudices between two communities and these result in different perspectives and negativity. Therefore, we carry out activities in order to teach foreigners our culture for the aim of overcoming this situation and ensuring their employment. We engage in activities at provincial and district level for our children and women in order to bring together two communities. These can be sportive activities for our children. These can be skills training or craft activities for women. Principally, we strive to get to know each other and contribute to overcoming presupposed prejudices so that people are not alienated. This is also critical for the security of local community, and for the hosted community not to feel alienated. Therefore, we organize meetings at district level, events for cultural meeting, and activities to mix two communities and teach our culture. We bring together our children and our families. If the people seeking asylum in Turkey used to have qualifications in their country, we aim for them to keep these qualifications when they return to their country; particularly activities for employment

are carried out for the Syrians to continue with their lives upon their return to their country without having lost their qualifications. At present, there are false facts such as these people receive too much aid and profanely, they are accustomed to getting things much easily or for free and these false facts create prejudices. We are working on correcting these false facts. We are meeting with opinion leaders from the local community and foreigners. We also work with the associations and NGOs such as IGAM and Red Crescent in this regard. This is the most important element for both our security and for a healthier coexistence: Our children are mixed now, they are at the same school; therefore, it is

very important that they know about each other, families know about each other and those prejudices are overcome. In this process, we aim to ensure that both communities know about each other's culture and facilitate coexistence so that these communities go on in a stable manner without disturbing each other, as well as eliminating prejudices. Various activities are carried out in provinces and districts for this aim and these activities are executed by the Directorate General of Migration Management and Provincial Directorate of Migration Management. In a nutshell, that is all I would like to say in this subject.

Metin Çorabatır

President of the Research Centre on Asylum and Migration

Today, 4 million foreigners are living in our country. This is the 9th year of the crisis. We have come across this problem as these people come to live with us at a time when we were not prepared. At first, we regarded these newcomers as temporary and the expression of "temporary" was also used in speeches. No one could foresee such a lengthy refugee crisis, but it turned out to be so. Now, it is critical how we manage this situation as Turkish society, with the managers at all levels, the community and institutions. Current situation in Turkey and the history of asylum seeking in Turkey caught us off guard.

Activities to strengthen employment, which is the theme for this conference, should be considered, or employment should be considered within the scope of social harmonization. Other components of this harmonization than employment include education and health, which are also very important. Accommodation and

staying in a pleasant place compatible with human dignity are the rights of all refugees. Employment should be ensured in view of all these factors.

There is a very important element and I will conclude by mentioning it. My personal opinion is that there is one thing that these people need most. They need someone as their guardian that they can communicate with, someone who embraces them to whom they can ask questions because they feel lonely somehow. They do not have a state to support them anymore, they are here now, and they are exposed to maltreatment from time to time. It is a big step for them that someone slightly reaches out to them and offers a hand of friendship. Of course, there are major barriers for employment. Problems such as the difficulty of obtaining work permits and high rate of non-registered employment in Turkish economy are those we need to work on right now. Still, we need to think about this employment issue without neglecting the humanitarian aspect of the situation. We need to ensure the environment that they can exercise their religious practices. We need to adopt such a holistic approach on the issue.

PRESENTATIONS

BEST PRACTICES: SHARING EXPERIENCE OF EMPLOYERS AND EMPLOYEES

- Zerrin Yağmuroğlu, İzmir Governorship, The EU and Foreign Relations Office
- Kamuran Dorukoğlu, IGAM Regional Integration Accelerators Project (RIAC)
- Mehmet Tezcan, Deputy Director of OSTIM Vocational Education Centre
- Merve Batıkan, Foundation for the Support of Women's Work
- Bülent Avcılar, Keçiören Migrant Services Centre



Zerrin Yağmuroğlu

*İzmir Governorship,
The EU and Foreign Relations Office*

Being the third largest city of Turkey, İzmir has become one of the places that refugees heavily preferred for settlement after the Syrian crisis. Konak, Karabağlar, Bornova and Buca are the most densely populated towns of İzmir and Syrians also mostly reside in there. Services including education, health and employment are part of the harmonization process of refugees in medium and long term; therefore, local and national institutions that offer such services must work in coordination.

Governorate of İzmir, as the highest public authority in the province, aimed to carry out activities to include the existing Syrian potential in our province in economy, develop projects that also involve the local community, whereby ensuring social harmonization and increasing registered employment, in line with the Strategic Plan developed by the Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Migration Management and the provisions of the “Directive on Work Permit of Foreigners with Temporary Protection” that was published on the Official Gazette dated 15.01.2016 and enforced thereafter.

“Supporting the National Institutions in Turkey to Mitigate the Impact of the Syrian Refugee Crisis” project, which was funded by the Instrument for Pre-Accession Financial Assistance second term (IPA-II) funds, having been initiated on 1st September 2016 and to be implemented for 36 months, with a budget amounting up to 40,000,000 Euro, was coordinated by the Directorate General of Migration Management and executed by the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR). In line of this project, Governorate of İzmir started with the project development activities that focus on social harmonization and employment in mid-2016 in order to benefit from the funding program.

How did we start with the Textile Machine Operator Training and Harmonization Project? First of all, we made use of the valuable data from İŞKUR. According to the labor market analysis report of the year 2017, textile (tailoring) sector is the top among the occupations that are most difficult to provide in İzmir. We see the similar sectors again, when we look at the year 2016. Why do we have a problem in providing staff for these sectors?

The most prominent reason is the difficulty of finding staff having the required vocational skills.

When we look at the distribution of the unemployed in İzmir in terms of education and sex, 54% is women and 46% is men. The group including the highest number of the unemployed is primary education level. It means that, overwhelmingly unqualified labor force applies to İŞKUR. Therefore, we identified a project for the primary school group with the highest rate of unemployment, and particularly women among the disadvantaged group as our target. Why did we focus on the area tailoring? It was a result of our talks with Olgun Aktaş, President of İzmir Chamber of Shirt Manufacturers, Tricot and similar Merchants and Tradesmen. President of the Chamber noted that they had 340 members that were actively operating, and they had a need for qualified staff. The most important element of this project was the employment commitment of the Chamber to the vocational courses of İŞKUR with an employment guarantee that also included Syrians under temporary protection within the scope of the relevant regulation.

Project that was officially launched with the Protocol signed on 10th January 2018 under the coordination of the Governorate of İzmir, with the partnership of the Provincial Directorate of National Education, Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, İzmir Union of Chambers of Merchants and Tradesmen, İzmir Chamber of Shirt Manufacturers, Tricot and similar Merchants and Tradesmen,

and Egedeniz Textile Inc., earned a comprehensive and institutionalized status that ensured public-NGO-private sector cooperation.

Coordinator: Governorate of İzmir (EU and Foreign Relations Office)

Partners:

- Provincial Directorate of National Education
- Provincial Directorate of Migration Management
- İzmir Union of Chambers of Merchants and Craftsmen
- İzmir Chamber of Shirt Manufacturers, Tri-cot and similar Merchants and Tradesmen
- Egedeniz Textile Inc.

Our Project was funded by UNHCR between 20th November 2017 – 31st July 2018. It has been funded by Turkish Crescent İzmir Community Center between 1st August 2018 – 31st July 2019.

Briefly, our Project objectives include the following:

General Objective:

- To ensure participation of Syrian foreigners under temporary protection, who are residing in İzmir and Turkish citizens who wish to work but do not have a profession in labor market with vocational education,
- To facilitate the harmonization of Syrians under Temporary Protection to the society and working life by providing Turkish language course at A1 level.

Specific Objectives:

- To contribute to the provision of staff that the textile sector needs,
- To encourage the participation of women in the courses by the children play room service where children in the 4-6 age group are hosted, and to ensure that they benefit from the job opportunities in the sector,
- To provide information and guidance for entrepreneurship in textile sector,
- To contribute to the acceleration of local integration by organizing social activities that include course trainees and their families.

Our center is located in Selviler district of

Karabağlar. The reasons for selecting this district are below:

- It is the most densely populated town.
- It is easy to reach from surrounding towns by public transport vehicles.
- The district that Syrians heavily reside in is Selvili.
- It is a district that has received internal migration particularly from Konya and Mardin, as well as being preferred by the local community with lower education and income level.
- For the employers, there are textile workshops in districts with easy transport opportunity to center (Bozyaka, Cennetçeşme, etc.).

As we started with this project, there was no example for us. We are not a center that only provides vocational training in tailoring, but we also organize social activities and seminars. We provide information on subjects such as residence and work permit. We aim to contribute to their social and working lives by preventing marriage at a young age, and taking up subjects of occupational health and safety. We also organize social activities, such as live music, outdoor breakfast events and workshops for children. We also invite out trainees' families and friends to our social activities as well as our trainees so that the prejudices between two communities can be overcome.

Briefly, when we look at what we have achieved in 1.5 years, we have reached out to the trainees in numbers specified on the table by means of our vocational courses.

Our pilot application regarding our project activities started on 29th January 2018. İŞKUR was not committed in our first pilot application and we conducted it with the UNHCR but İŞKUR has always been involved in the project in the courses that followed. I would like to draw your attention to the 3rd and 4th courses in particular, in which we reduced the number of participants because we focused on ensuring higher qualification and specialization.

We increased the hours of practical applications on machines. In 1.5 years, 130 people in total, 87 Syrian citizens and 43 Turkish citizens, completed the vocational courses with success and they were entitled to receive certificates. Fulfilling the employment commitment, job placement procedures of trainees were completed at the ratio of 20%.

Our requirements for the trainees are below:

- Residing in İzmir,
- Being a Turkish or Syrian citizen,
- Being literate,
- Having completed 18 years of age,
- Having no obstacle for employment,
- Meeting the requirements of being an İŞKUR trainee.

We received substantial applications before each course period. We identified our trainees with elaborate interviews. We asked following questions in the interviews:

Where did you hear about the center and the course?

- For foreigners: Do you receive a Red Crescent card?
- Does your spouse encourage you to work?
- Questions about their children (about their need for nursing and their school attendance)
- Why do you wish to participate in this course?

The street where our central meeting is situated was closed to traffic during formal opening, local community was invited, and our project had extensive media coverage with the high-level representation of all stakeholder institutions. It had coverage on newspapers and TRT News main news bulletin. The project has a Facebook page. Activities of the center and updated news on the trainees are shared and the questions of the trainees are answered on the page. As included in the protocol made with the stakeholders, a profit-oriented economic enterprise was to be established in order to ensure the sustainability of the project under the supervision and control of the Chamber, and entire machinery and hardware was to be transferred to this social operation. As the Governorate of İzmir, we will transfer the project with the Handover Protocol in July to this operation for which İzmir Chamber of Commerce registration was made as of 17th April 2019.

If you ask, how this economic operation is to bear operational cost, we aim to generate income from the products manufactured here, by also diversifying the products.

Refugees and disadvantaged local community here will be able to sustain their living by means of employment without needing support, if they are given the chance.

Kamuran Dorukoğlu

IGAM, Regional Integration Accelerators Project (RIAC)

Our project is entitled Regional Integration Accelerators (with the acronym RIAC) project. Our Project is funded by the European Union Employment and Social Innovation Program. Our Project has been carried out in Germany, Denmark, Turkey and Italy and it was launched on January 2018. Planned duration of our project is 30 months. It has been imple-

mented by eight different institutions in total in the countries I just mentioned.

Partners carry out their projects in their own region, their own country and in accordance with their own economic conditions. The objective of our project at regional level is to develop and test a model that accelerates the participation process of the refugees and/or asylum seekers to the labor market and ensures the sustainability of their employment in qualified jobs and also applies to other sectors, by taking into consideration the actual need of work



force of the employers and in the labor market. Actually, our project is based on an application that is implemented in Germany and Denmark as a governmental system and it is the version of this application which is developed as a project. However, we were challenged by some factors in Turkey. First and foremost, we carry out a market research and try to convince the employer who needs employees. However, it is not always easy since we are not a public institution. Then, we selected our participants and tried to proceed with an election method. As it was discussed yesterday, there are too many courses and these courses are regarded as a means to earn money. Yet, we realized that we needed to provide them some financial support for their expenditure of transport, lunch, etc. We talked to Parisli Cemil Kuaför (Hairdresser) as an employer. This hairdresser has 12 branches in Turkey and 5-6 branches in Ankara. It was genuinely interested in our project and hands-on training program. We also have two distinguished Turkish language teachers in our project team. We also provide mentorship service as part of our project. Having someone they can consult to with this mentorship regarding issues that they may come across at the workplace and in their daily lives helps them feel more secure and helps us receive more efficient feedback. On the other hand, this project has an accelerator aspect. Accelerator's mission is to help with any difficulty that may come up.

Number of participants targeted by the institutions is as specified on the table above. Obtaining a work permit for our participants has been one of the factors that challenged us most. Our observation was that it was generally regarding Syrians under temporary protection in current projects. It was not our practice; in applications we accepted participants regardless of their country of origin. Our three trainees received work permit within the scope of the first part of our project and they started working. In the second group, women participants were also present. We obtained work permit for 5 of them. Reasons why we use hands-on training program are below:

- Short term accident and health insurance,
- Daily wage,
- 50% employment guarantee.

I would like to talk about our challenges.

- İŞKUR's participant quotes,
- Ministry of Labor's quotes on employing foreigners,
- Non-issue of work permits,
- Downsizing of companies,
- Increase in minimum wage,
- Work permit charges

These were the factors that challenged us.

We did not have a problem with Syrians within the scope of our Project. We did not have a problem with obtaining work permits for our Syrian participants under temporary protection or those having short term residency. However,

we had almost 50% failure in general, in the work permits of non-Syrian participants. We had considerable difficulty as we applied and obtained work permit for them. Of course, it affected our employment figures.

For us, as IGAM, to achieve our project objective, we need to ensure the employment of 24 people more by the end of the project duration.

It is getting more and more difficult to do this, it is difficult to find employers. We are also affected by the deteriorating negative perception on refugees. After lengthy research, we found OSTİM Vocational Training Center and we directed our students to the apprenticeship school there. This is the end of my presentation, thank you all for listening.

Mehmet Tezcan

Deputy Director of OSTİM Vocational Education Centre

Our Center met with the Syrians living in our country under temporary protection and hosting Turkish communities in 2016. We ensured the training of 1200 people from about 40 groups at our center and completed the vocational training course with the cooperation with GIZ, Association of Anatolia Vocational Education and OSTİM Vocational Training Center. We also ensured that they were guided towards employment. We have seen the potential in about 4 million foreigners in our country and started with our activities.

It facilitates our activities that formal institutions, particularly education institutions, are supported by the NGOs and that they undertake some or most of the workload by means of cooperation. As we proceeded by walking, we

achieved results by running thanks to the trade unions. In this regard, our school ranks the top in Turkey in terms of placing the Syrians in establishments with registered employment and of social and economic integration of employment. As we embarked in this activity, we suffered from demotivating incidents, but we embarked in it convinced that we would succeed and I try to describe this situation in all relevant conferences and organizations. The system of vocational training centers is quite necessary for foreigners under temporary protection who are non-registered workers and for refugees under international protection. Because individuals avoid registered employment as they will lose the assistance provided with Kızılay card, if they have it, or they get another job. Here, the employer is under risk. Our Ministry has a Circular since 2018 on the orientation of these individuals to vocational training.

Merve Batıkan

Foundation for the Support of Women's Work (KEDV)

Hello all, I am Merve BATIKAN from KEDV. I would like to thank those who have organized this conference on behalf of our Foundation. I will talk about the programs that we carry out for the employment of refugee women during the period allocated to KEDV. Before that,

I would like to give you some information about KEDV. KEDV, which has a status of public interest organization, was founded in 1986. It provides support for low-income women to improve their quality of living and their environment, and to empower them economically. It works with the women groups at local level with a participatory approach. KEDV aims to empower women to change their lives, their community and the world for the aim of creating a society

without inequality and poverty.

KEDV ensures that women establish cooperatives so that they embark in joint ventures in social and economic areas, for the aim of creating the women-centered local development examples and strengthen their leadership in society. In 2002, KEDV launched the establishment of cooperatives for women with the women groups it worked with. Women cooperatives are important instruments for ensuring the registered integration of the women who are not working, working from home, or those who are seasonal workers or subcontracted labor, and refugee women who cannot be employed due to language barrier, discrimination at work place on grounds of social gender, vocational skills, income level, education level or children care to economy and for increasing the employment of poor women. Establishment of women cooperatives supports the social empowerment of poor women and accelerates the social harmonization of refugee women and children.

Women who have never stepped out of their home and who could not benefit from social, economic and cultural facilities meet at women cooperatives. Women identify the problems and needs of their districts and carry out activities for their solution, engage in dialogues with authorities at district level and are involved in decision-making processes.

I would like to talk about the programs that we carried out with our Women Cooperatives in the field of migration and the results obtained in terms of increasing the employment of refugee women. We work with the women from the local community to encourage the establishment of cooperatives in order to support the inclusion of refugee women to the economic activities, social activities and training of the existing women cooperatives, increasing their employment opportunities and employability, and creating an environment of social harmonization.

We organize trainings in Harran, Gaziantep, İstanbul, Mardin and İzmir under the themes of Leadership and Social Gender, Respecting

Differences, Entrepreneurship, Community Action Research, Establishing Cooperatives and Organization under the Organization and Empowerment Programs for Refugee and Migrant Women. Of course, establishing cooperatives is just the beginning of organization. It is very important for the sustainability of the cooperative that the whole process is adopted by the aspirant women, and the equal participation from local and refugee women is ensured.

Our purpose with the Early Childhood Education program for Refugee and Local Children is to create common places for women and children, develop programs to be implemented with local and refugee children, and finally to support the development of refugee children and facilitate social harmonization.

We aim for the refugee women to engage in sustainable economic relations by means of Economic Empowerment Programs for Refugee and Migrant Women with trainings on product development, design, pricing, branding, and by supporting them in developing their production capacity and mapping with the market.

Establishment of SADA women's cooperative in Gaziantep was supported in cooperation with ILO Turkey in 2019. A needs' identification study was carried out to understand the situation and needs of the women who benefit from the courses provided by SADA Women Development and Solidarity Center, and to evaluate their approaches to entrepreneurship and establishment of cooperatives. Trainings for the core group with a wide participation and capacity development activities were carried out with the themes of women cooperatives, establishment of cooperatives, the functioning and management of the same, partnership, strategic planning, division of labor, social gender and leadership. 103 people in total participated in the trainings from local and refugee women. Counselling in legal matters was provided by means of women cooperatives and SADA Women's Cooperative was established. One point that we, as KEDV, are sensitive about

about is to form a balance of power between the local women and refugee women. To this end, co-member / representative system has been developed. Successful examples to boost motivation were shared, and it was ensured that they meet with representatives from other women cooperatives. İlk Adım Women's Cooperative example that incorporated refugee women in their activities was especially effective. SADA Women's Cooperative was peered with Simurg Women's Cooperatives Union and Communication Network; it was invited to Simurg Eastern-South Eastern Regional Coordination Meeting so that an opportunity was provided to meet with the other women's cooperatives in the region. SADA Women's Cooperative that has identified its vision as «to ensure the economic and social empowerment of women with the solidarity of women from Turkey and refugee women» as a result of the training and cooperative establishment activities carried out, now operates in the areas of food, textile, and shoe and bag production with 53 partners in total, 35 being refugees.

It was aimed to ensure that disadvantaged refugee, migrant and local women to develop skills in line with their needs and support them with the production, marketing and sales of handcraft products, and ensuring the participation of refugee women also in the economic and social empowerment studies within the cooperatives, by means of the programs carried out in İlk Adım and Harmoni Women's Cooperatives in İstanbul with the cooperation with GPP in 2017-2019 years. More than 80 refugee women identified the problems for themselves, their families and their districts as a result of the trainings that they received in the İlk Adım Women's Cooperative. Discrimination, accommodation, supporting children at school, Turkish language teaching and economic empowerment were the areas identified as the prominent needs.

Now, let us look at the reflection of all of our activities on daily life;

- Social harmonization of refugee women

was enhanced in the districts they lived.

- Larger number of refugee women participated in the production activities, organizations and trainings in women's cooperatives and were involved in economic life.
- Communication and interaction between local and refugee women were increased.
- Refugee women who did not have a previous working experience developed skills.
- Difficulties in women's participation in economic life were decreased with the early childhood education that was provided for the children of refugee women.
- Refugee women were equipped with the proficiency to identify their problems and needs and find a solution.

Now, communication and interaction between refugee women and women from Turkey increased in both cooperatives; refugee women have become the partners of the İlk Adım Women's Cooperative; they cannot be founders but they can be cooperative partners. They have assumed very active roles in management. Refugee women continue to participate in the economic activities of the cooperatives with their products. KEDV Economic Establishment Nahlı supports refugee women with product development and market access. As the skills training for women is planned, skills and competencies that they already have are taken as basis; however, it is essential that training content for the production of design products which are innovative and will be demanded in the market is developed and it is critical for the sustainability of production.

As we plan our future studies, what should be our priorities and objectives, what are the problems and needs, I would like to talk about these. Refugee women need to be supported in terms of raising their children, problems with discrimination, violence, those encountered in relation to the problems at school, etc. Capacity of the nursery schools run by women's cooperatives must be increased so that more children can be included in early childhood education.



Also, refugee families need to be encouraged to be more active in parent-teacher associations. Turkish language teaching is critically important.

It must be a priority to ensure the sustainable participation of refugee women in women cooperatives to economic operations. This requires the following:

- Physical space, materials and equipment support, strong organizational structures must be ensured.
- Production areas of cooperatives must be expanded, product development operations that are innovative for the Turkish market and will be demanded must be continued. Skills training for refugee women must be planned accordingly.
- It will be important to support the visibility and marketing of the cooperative products. (fair attendance, e-trade, SM, direct mar-

keting methods, etc.)

Factors required for the sustainability of cooperatives,

- Establishment of an efficient legal environment,
- Tax exemptions and discounts,
- Decreasing the compulsory expenditures in the process of establishment and operation,
- Facilitating participation in public procurements, and facilitating cooperation with municipalities,

Lastly, Women Cooperatives, which are the first social cooperatives of Turkey, are efficient models for responding to the multi-faceted needs of women in Turkey, as well as refugee women. However, there is a need for support in terms of legislation, access to financial resources, business idea development, sustainability and institutional capacity development.

Bülent Avcılar

Keçiören Municipality, Coordinator of Keçiören Migrant Services Center

Keçiören Migrant Services Center is opened to operate in order to facilitate the migrants' and refugees' access to various public services such as health, education, social assistance and social services, psycho-social support, employment, and to make available further services that they need in an effective, cooperative

and integrated manner, and to contribute to the strengthening of social harmonization between the local community and refugee community in Keçiören. We started with this activity in August 2016. Our center will continue with its operations by the end of 2019. Number of foreign nationals who resided in Keçiören region was about 11,000 when we started with this project with the support of the United Nations, International Organization for Migration and USA Bureau of Population, Refugees and Migration. Today, this figure is around 25,000.

Our center operates in the field for providing information-guidance services to migrants and refugees in Keçiören, developing the capacity of public officials in Keçiören town in terms of service provision to migrants and refugees, supporting social harmonization and developing social union. As we generally carry out guidance operations for the population, health, national education directorates or schools under the District Governorate of Keçiören, our capacity development activities include awareness raising of the public personnel therein, as well as improving their legislative knowledge and providing them with the required technical support.

It is the general objective of this project to effectively utilize the operational strength of the local administrations in the field, for the implementation of migration management and integration policies over local administrations. As we intend to develop this model, our framework organization Union of Municipalities in Turkey (TBB) comes into play. TBB has a system of BELBİS. Assistance provided to Turkish citizens is carried out over this system. Consultations were made concerning how this system can be used for the service provision for refugees. We are trying to see if a system that is developed by our part can be integrated with TBB into BELBİS. If so, it is a critical system for categorizing the services that many municipalities provide for migrants, particularly in border regions under one datum, and preventing the repetition of the assistance and services provided.

Counselling units of our Center includes the following:

- Legal Support Unit
- Education Counselling Unit
- Health Counselling Unit
- Job-Occupation Counselling Unit
- Social Aids and Services Counselling Unit
- Psycho-Social Support Unit
- Educational-Social and Cultural Activities Unit

Each counselling unit provides the required information and guidance in their respective areas, with the assistance of translators whose mother tongue is Arabic. Also, each unit can perform educational and social harmonization activities in the field in their respective areas. 18,292 applications were received in total for counselling and guidance services from 24th October 2016, the date which the Keçiören Migrant Services Center started to operate, to 31st May 2019.

In relation to the conference theme, I would like to talk about the job-occupational counselling unit. Services provided by this unit are below:

- Providing information on work permit methods,
- Support for job search and employment process,
- Support for opening up business,
- Counselling services are provided concerning appropriate vocational courses for registration and guidance towards these courses.



Most frequent applications to this unit cover the issues given below:

- Refugees who cannot obtain work permit, non-registered and low-paid working conditions incompatible with human dignity with a heavy schedule
- Refugee recruitment method is considered complicated by employers and they do not want to deal with it
- Problems associated with the quite challenging nature for refugees to find a job over İŞKUR

There are about more than 10 vocational courses at KEÇMEKs (Keçiören Vocational Training Centers) owned by the Keçiören Municipality. 12 active vocational branches are available in these courses. We provide the necessary guidance by means of our center. We ensured that foreigners are also included in these courses through capacity development and awareness raising activities. Turkish language courses are available for adults in line with the requests received by our job-occupational counselling unit. Refugees who cannot obtain work permit was one of the critical areas for us. We provided support with the work permit charges. Considering the school drop-outs, they usually drop out of school at high school level. When they are 14-15 years of age, children start to work as an apprentice. As we were thinking about the ways to combat this situation, vocational education centers came into play. There are many active vocational training centers in Ankara; one of them in OSTİM and one in Sincan. OSTİM Vocational Training Center is very open to working with refugees. We particularly picked school drop-out children from the field to guide them towards these centers. Doing this, we were always concerned if we happened to

encourage them to child labor. Because 4 out of 5 days are spent with practical training with the master and 1 day is spent with theoretical education at vocational training centers. We aimed to ensure that the school drop-out children particularly at the high school age but not enrolled to school are identified, by also talking to their parents, and registered in order to guide them towards vocational training centers if the child is really working with an employer, in coordination with Keçiören Directorate of National Education so that their follow-up by the school can be facilitated and any abuse can be prevented. Vocational training centers are different from vocational high schools in that children receive a quite higher wage by working with social security. At the same time, they have the chance to get a diploma by continuing their open education. One of the operations we will carry out in the upcoming term is to open up etude centers to support their formal education.

One of our stakeholders in the field is İŞKUR. We have been accredited to the system of İŞKUR and we can enter the job applications from our center in this system. Thereby, we can make some job placements much faster. We know that almost 20% of our entries have been placed in jobs over this system.

I would like to briefly talk about the coordination council. Having a very efficient structure, this council convenes with the participation of the district directors of national education and health, as well as the Mayor, chaired by the District Governor with the agenda of migration, only. Our agenda includes possible solutions to be developed according to the problems identified by the Migrant Services Center in the field. We get quite rapid solutions as the problems are discussed at the highest level.

ROUNDTABLE 1:

STATUS, RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS OF FOREIGNERS IN THE FRAMEWORK OF SOCIAL HARMONIZATION

Moderator:

Özge Bayar - *Ankara PDMM, Head of Working Group for Temporary Protection*

Rapporteur:

Elif Özge Uslu - *Ankara PDMM, Migration Expert*

Participants:

Ayşe Özdemir - *Türkiye Diyanet Association*

Burak Uyan - *Refugee Support Center*

Derya Uysal - *Red Umbrella*

Dilara Türker - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Erkan Can Çakıroğlu - *Refugee Support Center*

Handan Erdoğan - *Türkiye Diyanet Association*

Merve Nur Gül - *Türk Kızılayı*

Nisan Özdemir - *Türk Kızılayı*

Özge Bayar - *Ankara PDMM*

Av. Sinem Çakan - *Ankara PDMM*

Zehra Temurtaş - *Türkiye Diyanet Association*

Questions

- **What are the effects of the existing status of foreigners in our country on social harmonization?**
- **What are the rights and responsibilities that can accelerate social harmonization? What is the current situation in our country about these issues?**
- **What can be done in terms of the status, rights and responsibilities to improve social harmonization?**

Notes

Roundtable activity started by discussing concepts related to the migration terminology. Definitions of the statuses such as refugee, conditional refugee, secondary protection and temporary protection were reiterated in accordance with the law. Geographical restriction introduced to the 1951 Geneva Convention was mentioned. Although the temporary protection status has the connotation of being a guest and being temporary, it has been noted that the people with this status have become permanent in our country, a harmonization issue has come into play, and this year should be declared the harmonization year.

Views were expressed on the difficulty for the people regarded as guests to harmonize with the society and to be accepted by the society, in relation to the themes of employment and social harmonization that entail integration. Views were expressed on the requirement to reconsider the geographical reservation introduced to the 1951 Geneva Convention with 1967 Protocol in view of today's situation; or our country to include these individuals to the already existing statuses or provide a new legal stay right that is appropriate to their situation that does not include the word "temporary". This view was elaborated by giving examples with the opinion that the people with the legal status of Temporary Protection have been residing in our country for 8 years, which causes ghettoization and instigates xenophobia. Importance of the

harmonization of children and young people were noted, as a child who came to our country at the age of 10 is a young person at the age of 18, today.

The view that their status has an effect on social harmonization was elaborated with the example, indicating that the people with residency permit have a higher level of education and language proficiency; therefore, they can be more successful in harmonization, while the education level of those with temporary protection and international protection is relatively lower in general.

Round table participants expressed their opinions on the difficulty of providing occupation in Turkey to the people who were not used to participate in employment in their country of origin. Consensus was reached among the participants on the inefficiency of the projects developed for employment and harmonization to have an impact on the field. It was emphasized that volunteering and the number of participants must be increased to overcome this situation. The importance of setting the balance between the citizens and foreigners was emphasized in terms of the rights and responsibilities in the operations carried out for foreigners.

The dual nature of harmonization was highlighted. Examples were given from Önder District in Altındağ. It was stated by a field operator active in the region that the achievement of Syrian students resulted in faction at schools,

giving the example that children are affected by the opinions of their parents who are Turkish citizens on foreigners, and reflect these opinions to their Syrian class mates. Consensus was reached on the importance of making contributions also available to the Turkish families in need as the contributions in kind are being distributed in the contribution region due to the poverty issue that is in common, as well as the dual nature of harmonization.

Perception of foreigners in Turkey was discussed. A participant suggested that there are two types of xenophobia in our country; one being the hate speech instigated by the stereotypes, false facts and prejudices of the people with limited contact with foreigners, and the other being the grudge held by the individuals who are in contact with foreigners and have the same economic level with them. Competency of poverty was highlighted. It was noted that it is considered acceptable that foreigners are forced to work for lengthy hours for a low wage under rather difficult conditions. It was observed that the hate speech was decreased; however, when the citizens were approached, it tends to increase when it comes to rights and responsibilities, and they were disturbed by being equal or being regarded as equal. Here, the importance of media was highlighted and the importance of providing the citizens correct information on the amount and conditions of the aid for foreigners, as well as the quality of rights and services provided to them. It was suggested that it would prevent the replication of in-kind contributions especially, by making available aids to foreigners under a general roof, as well as ensuring that the right material required is made available to the right family, and they noted the importance for the project developers to keep in touch. Also, it was agreed that the Directorate General of Migration Management should act as the main playmaker for the solution of prob-

lems by the compilation of different problems under a general roof, which were observed by the international organizations and NGOs in different locations at the local level.

Views were expressed for conducting a general sector research in Turkey to obtain a sectoral data in terms of employment and making a distribution according to the needs, not exploiting İŞKUR support, taking the needs of the employers into consideration, placement of foreigners in jobs in parallel with the courses that they received, and controlling non-registered working and child labor. It was argued that it is particularly difficult for the widowed women to participate in employment due to the child-care issue; therefore, the idea of establishing markets was suggested where they could sell the products that they can produce at home. However, an objection was made to this idea on grounds that it might increase child labor as domestic production is difficult to inspect. One participant suggested that Syrians have good craft skills; therefore, their own production facilities can be established where only Syrians can work in employment areas in which they are particularly knowledgeable and prone, so that they can be withdrawn from the areas which are dominated by Turkish workers. However, counterarguments were suggested on grounds that it could instigate xenophobia.

Round table activity was concluded by agreement on suggestions that xenophobia/hatred is not at racism level, although we have had a previous migration history in our territory, a migration at this scale has not been experienced before, current economic situation in Turkey and unemployment also seem to instigate xenophobia/hatred, and according to the evaluations, not only foreign nationals of Syria and Iraq, but also other nationals of like Afghanistan and Somali who live in our country are exposed to xenophobia.

ROUNDTABLE 2:

THE IMPORTANCE OF TURKISH LANGUAGE AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING IN THE FRAMEWORK OF SOCIAL HARMONIZATION: SUSTAINABILITY OF EMPLOYMENT

Moderator:

Esra Yurt - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Rapporteur:

İrem Aynagöz - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Participants:

A. Özge Gürer - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Bilge Pınar Yenigün Turan - *GIZ (The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit)*

Burçin Oflu - *United Work*

Duygu Karanfil - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Fatma Özen - *Türkiye Diyanet Foundation*

Gül Erdost - *UN Population Fund*

Mehmet Altay Sevinç - *Türk Kızılayı*

Merve Işık Elsıkma - *Yunus Emre Institute*

Murat Akbaş - *UN Development Programme*

Nilüfer Kol - *Yunus Emre Institute*

Turan Fırıncioğulları - *Watan Foundation*

Zerrin Şimşek - *İzmir Governance*

Is there a particular resistance among refugees to learning Turkish?

Participants noted that there is a resistance among refugees to learning Turkish. Reasons for that are given below:

- As refugees live in isolation and as a community, they think that they do not need to speak in Turkish.
- As they mostly work in employment areas which require physical labor they cannot use Turkish language there.
- As women refugees are less socialized than men, they cannot learn the language since they rather spend their time at home.
- Due to the word “guest” used for refugees, they do not think that they are permanent in Turkey; therefore, they do not need to learn.

Efficiency and quality of courses, do they reach out to sufficient number of people?

It is agreed that the quality of courses is not good enough and they do not reach out to sufficient number of people. The ways to improve efficiency were discussed.

Suggestions to improve efficiency:

- Course participants should not be given per diem. In cases where per diem is given, imposing the obligation to participate in general Turkish language course, as well as vocational Turkish language course may improve efficiency.
- Availability of higher fund from project may improve the quality of materials used.
- Courses can be provided in daytime and night time. In this way, participation ratio may increase.
- It was argued that Turkish courses provided by TÖMER are rather focused on academic Turkish language teaching and it is not very useful for all refugees. It will be useful to teach skills like speaking and writing, as well as academic Turkish language teach-

ing in the courses.

- A standard shall be applied to the resources used and all teaching materials shall be standardized by improving their quality.
- Certificates given by the courses shall have a validity in working life and the validity of certificates must become a common practice.
- It is a disadvantage that private organizations, NGOs do not have the authority to open up courses. They should be given the authority to open up courses.
- Examinations held at the end of the courses should be held according to the European language portfolio.
- A system should be developed in which they can learn Turkish in any area (such as speaking, writing, listening, etc.)
- Training and curriculum development must be carried out for Turkish language teachers.

How to ensure sustainability of employment?

It was agreed that the sustainability of employment is very critical.

Recommendations:

- Public policies need to be developed.
- Process of issuing work permit is quite costly and lengthy. It should be improved.
- Refugees need to be guided towards employment for white collar jobs, as well. Not only physical labor.
- It must be discussed how refugees can be included in existing employment areas.
- Equivalence problem must be addressed, and relevant operations must be carried out.
- Traveling obstacle is a barrier for refugees to find a job. There must be a solution to the problem of traveling obstacle.
- Both business Turkish and Turkish language teaching must be made available. Trainings must be organized in which refugees are required to participate to both.

ROUNDTABLE 3: UNIVERSITY GRADUATES AND FOREIGNERS WITH PROFESSIONS & FOREIGN GRADUATES FROM TURKISH UNIVERSITIES AND THEIR ACCESS TO THE LABOUR MARKET

Moderator:

Dr. Altan Özkil - *Atılım University*

Rapporteur:

Büşra Efe - *Middle East Technical University*

Participants:

Aylin Yıldız - *Presidency for Turks Abroad and Related Communities*

E. Gülce İskender - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Elif Özkaya Aydın - *US Embassy*

Fatih Şahin - *TOBB University of Economics and Technology*

İbrahim Kurtulan - *Turkish Confederation of Employer Unions*

Mehlika Tellioğlu - *UN Refugee Agency*

Pelin Eroğlu - *Presidency for Turks Abroad and Related Communities*

Ramazan Çınar - *Kırıkkale University*

Sümeyye Salarvan - *UN Refugee Agency*

How do you consider the current situation in the employment of the foreigners who are graduates of higher education and/or have a profession? (Preparation to Higher Education)

- **The problem of Examination for Foreign Students (EFS):** Inefficiency of EFS courses. Those which are for free are very few, and those for a fee are too costly. Its target audience was different. NGOs might have a project on this subject. 3- or 6-month courses. Information can be provided on EFS. There is a quota for foreign students at universities. EFS is not a central examination, it is held by universities. Psychological support during the preparation process for EFS. The way EFS is perceived by the local community is an issue; awareness raising among the local community.
- **Problem of language learning:** Trauma caused by language must be studied. Psychological preparation to higher education. Students graduated from open high school have a linguistic problem as they attend the university. They have critical problems with reading and writing, rather than speaking. Package training must be provided. Existing language courses are not efficient for university graduates. There are YTB practices in this field. There should be language courses at university.
- **Employability concerns after graduation:** The question mark of "What can I do" is common among the clients. HR support is also provided. Still, they are not very pessimistic; usually families seem to be obstructive.
- **Family structure, participation to educa-**

tion: Particularly girls' attendance to school. Boys' participation in labor force. Sending girls to school is considered as a sin. It is regarded as a problem that they work with boys. Working hours in Turkey are different.

- **Harmonization with the students, integration:** Difficulty of making friends, there are cultural differences. Religion is interpreted differently. Teachers categorize according to the ethnic origin. Our students do not ever think of turning it to an advantage.

What kind of problems are encountered in the employment of the foreigners who are graduates of higher education and/or have a profession? (Current Situation and Problems)

- **The problem of equivalence:** Although there is no equivalence problem in engineering, for example, they wish to go abroad. Equivalence is expected for architects. There are foreign students in all Theology departments now. Doctors, in temporary health centers and private hospitals. Equivalence process is very difficult, they cannot bring documents on their own, it is very difficult to receive confirmation. Also, translation and other operations have a significant financial load. A different testing method could be developed for those who cannot submit a diploma. Additional training can be provided. Funding could be made available for this subject. It can take more than a year to finalize an application process.
- **Work permit:** Important obstacles for work permit. There is a work permit regulation only for Syrians. Management of ESN aid.

What are the overriding factors in the employment of the foreigners who are graduates of higher education and/or have a profession? (prominent elements such as sectoral distribution)

- Let's discuss sectoral distribution. Doctors and teachers can be employed fairly easily in some centers but for lawyers it is very difficult to be employed, since they do not know about the civil law, for example.

What are the effects of the employment of the foreigners who are graduates of higher education and/or have a profession in our country? (Its effect on employment in Turkey)

- Its effect on our employment. They cannot work in their own field; a friend who is me-

chanical engineer works as an interpreter. They are trying to become citizens. It is aimed to overcome the negative perception. Scholarship awarded to the Turkish students and foreigners is different.

- Benefiting from good practices.
- Its positive effects on employment in Turkey
- Positive reactions in white collar; while negative reactions in blue collar.
- What can be done to decrease negative effect on employment?

Finally, let's go back to the brain drain and the issue of returning (Brain Drain).

- Those who think about going abroad, brain drain. All the problems that we talk about already result in brain drain.
- They may be encouraged to stay here by supporting entrepreneurship.
- First, the profile of the people must be identified.
- Population movement, they can only work in the province they are registered to, it is a huge obstacle.
- Turkey is regarded as a step.
- They prefer brain drain as they do not have a legal status.

ROUNDTABLE 4: EMPLOYMENT ALTERNATIVES FOR FOREIGNERS LIVING IN TURKEY: ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND SOCIAL COOPERATIVES

Moderator:

Assoc. Prof. Nihal Eminoğlu - *Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University*

Rapporteur:

Kerim Can Kara - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Participants:

Ecem Eş - *Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services*

Ahmet Doğukan Örtlek - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Merve Batıkan - *Foundation for the Support of Women's Work*

Serra Cankur - *Foundation for the Support of Women's Work*

Anastasia Pazer - *Konrad Adenauer Foundation*

Dilek Körükçü - *UN Refugee Agency*

Selime Keskin - *UN Refugee Agency*

Nilay Özlem Türkmen - *Ministry of Commerce*

Aylin Tunalılar - *Ministry of Commerce*

M. Murat Candemir - *UN Development Programme*

H. Baran Topsever - *RET International*

Turker Saliji - *The Research Centre on Asylum and Migration*

Questions

- **Why is it important for foreigners to be entrepreneurs?**
- **What kind of entrepreneurship? Opportunistic entrepreneurs / forced entrepreneurs / creative entrepreneurship**
- **For which groups are we talking about being entrepreneurs? Are we talking about those who were already entrepreneurs and employers back in Syria and whose are currently in Turkey, or are we talking about guiding those without any previous similar experience to become entrepreneurs?**
- **Which institutions and persons can and should be the supporters of entrepreneurship?**
- **How can cooperation be established with the Turks?**
- **In what areas are the entrepreneurs required?**
- **Would the discourse on the return of the Syrians affect entrepreneurship?**

Notes

Within this framework, first of all, it must be noted that entrepreneurship must be considered important in terms transforming from just a consumer society into a productive one. Inspired by the title of a project undertaken by TUGODER, in a society created by a collection of people “who do not beg, who are winners and helping others to become winners”, it is essential that sustainable development can be made possible.

In the working group, based on this principle, the issue of paving the way for refugees and disadvantaged groups was primarily discussed. It was concluded that it is not possible to talk at the same level about the targets to become entrepreneurs and the possibilities and challenges faced by those groups (foreigners) immigrating to our country as economic migrants, expats (experts) and/or volunteers and about the issue of becoming “entrepreneurs” in the guest country of the mass groups who have been obliged to emigrate from their home country due to force majeure and have arrived with the aim of taking refuge in a new country.

Therefore, by the word foreigners, the refugee groups in our country, in particular the Syrians within these groups in terms of being in the highest number, constitute the backbone of the discussion.

Entrepreneurship of refugees in our country, in particular of the Syrians, is being promoted for two main reasons:

- Ensuring economic development in our country and its continuity
- When considered as part of social harmonization, entrepreneurship is a factor that brings societies closer together and places perception and discourse on a more realistic basis

From this point of view, Entrepreneurship should not be seen as a subject specific to groups with large-scale trade and business capacities; it should also be an encouraging factor for women and young refugees who have never been engaged in trade and who are not aware of their potential in this sense.

Considering the divergence of entrepreneurship such as opportunistic, forced and creative

entrepreneurship, which of the foregoing would be dealt with in terms of the working groups was discussed and an inclusive perspective has been adopted in this framework. In this sense, the following has been included:

- Promoting creative entrepreneurship for disadvantaged refugees (in particular women and youth),
- Opportunistic entrepreneurship where a win-win situation will be created with active use of the market in the country of residence by refugee groups with previous experience in entrepreneurship and the business world,
- Forced entrepreneurs who don't have many options to maintain their lives and resort to entrepreneurship as a way out in compulsory circumstances.

Within this framework, looking at the institutions/organizations and persons that will promote entrepreneurship in our country, it has been discovered that the addressees must be distinguished for large-scale entrepreneurs, small-/medium-scale entrepreneurs and those who are new to entrepreneurship.

For large-scale entrepreneurship:

- The Ministry of Industry and Technology to make the country an attraction for investors and ensure regional infrastructure works,
- The Ministry of Treasury and Finance to provide the financial facilities aimed at encouraging the Turkish enterprises into engaging in joint ventures with refugees,
- The Ministry of Trade, in particular for an inclusive review and reformulation of the legislation for foreigners,
- Organizations such as TÜSİAD, TURKONFED, TOBB and Trade Chambers that could play an active role in developing cooperation with the public.

For small-/medium-scale entrepreneurship and beginners:

- Local Governments, based on the principle that "Social harmonization starts at the local level",
- Village headmen and opinion leaders for

carrying out neighborhood-based activities with refugees on the basis of needs,

- Non-Governmental Organizations carrying out the highest number of activities in the field,
- Techno-cities and Socio-cities,
- TURKONFED, Trade Chambers, private sector cooperation.
- Again, the steps to be taken in the field of legislation are important at this point, as well.

Social cooperatives present themselves as a solution to encourage Entrepreneurship in general. In this case, it is essential that foreigners and refugees are included in existing cooperatives and the relevant impediments be removed. Although the current legislation allows for foreigners to participate in cooperatives, it prevents them from being in management positions. Considering the present circumstances, it is recommended to review this situation and to use cooperatives as an effective method of entrepreneurship with more inclusive arrangements for foreigners and refugees.

In this regard, it is seen that many of the existing women's co-operatives are working efficiently and many refugee women are introduced to social cooperatives through NGOs working on women. It is recommended that this example of good practice becomes mainstream and even serves as a model for youth cooperatives that are not well developed.

It is observed that the working method of the relevant NGOs is indirectly engaging women and youth in entrepreneurship. The working method in this regard could be summarized as follows:

- Meeting women for establishing cooperation on the basis of needs in each neighborhood and commencing the work,
- Determination of needs together with women,
- Carrying out comprehensive social harmonization trainings for refugee and host women, thereby ensuring information

and awareness and contributing to the formation of a social harmonization environment,


- Organizing joint activities and events for refugee groups and host community,
- Inclusion of refugees in economic activities, training and events performed in existing cooperatives, ensuring equal participation in decision-making processes of cooperatives. At this point, attention must be paid that technical skill trainings for refugee women are aimed at developing products suitable for the market, and the trainings must be planned accordingly.
- Public-NGO-private sector cooperation must be enhanced.


In addition, designing different grant schemes

and encouraging the private sector to take initiatives in this regard point to another solution that will increase entrepreneurship.


During all such work for promoting entrepreneurship among refugees, the need to stay out of the discussions as to whether the Syrians will be going back to their country is one of the main issues mutually agreed upon by the working group. Irrespective of whether the Syrians living in our country will go back to their home country or not, during their stay in the host country, entrepreneurship and social cooperatives must be supported with the aim of both improving their living standards and contributing to the development of the country through enhanced social harmonization.




 İlticaVeGocArastirmalariMerkezi

 igam_igamder

 www.igamder.org

 igam@igamder.org



 www.ankara.goc.gov.tr

